

JPRS-NEA-92-092

21 JULY 1992



FOREIGN  
BROADCAST  
INFORMATION  
SERVICE

---

***JPRS Report***

**Near East &  
South Asia**

---

**PAKISTAN**

# Near East & South Asia

## PAKISTAN

JPRS-NEA-92-092

## CONTENTS

21 July 1992

### POLITICAL

#### International Affairs

Foreign Secretary Responds to Israeli 'Threats' /London AL-WASAT 6 Jul]	1
Sources Report Peruvian Sale of Mirage-2000's /London AL-HAYAH 1 Jul]	2

#### Internal Affairs

President Khan Assures Continuity of Nuclear Program /JANG 26 May]	3
President Urged To Ignore Pressure Against Nuclear Program /JANG 27 May]	4
Atomic Energy Commission Director Resigns /THE MUSLIM 20 Jun]	4
Nation's Leaders Seen Out of Touch With People /THE MUSLIM 9 Jun]	5
Sindh: Ameliorating Attitude Recommended to Army /THE MUSLIM 17 Jun]	6
Articles View Consequences of Military Action in Sindh	7
Only Removing Symptoms /DAWN 17 Jun]	7
Political Solution Needed /DAWN 11 Jun]	9
Outcome in Doubt /DAWN 10 Jun]	10
Sindhi Press Sees Shortcomings /THE MUSLIM 27 Jun]	11
Economic Rehabilitation Needed /THE MUSLIM 27 Jun]	12
President Responsible /THE MUSLIM 26 Jun]	14
Solutions Not Easy /THE MUSLIM 26 Jun]	15
Representative Government Needed /THE MUSLIM 25 Jun]	16
MQM Mafia Exposed /THE MUSLIM 23 Jun]	18
Beg Praises Military Role /THE MUSLIM 23 Jun]	18
Sindh Military Operations Analyzed	19
Expanded Operation Needed /NAWA-I-WAQT 17 Jun]	19
Impacting National Politics /NAWA-I-WAQT 15 Jun]	19
Commentary Views Senate Happenings, Sindh Situation /THE MUSLIM 19 Jun]	22
Sindh: PPP Reiterates Illegitimacy of Rulers /THE MUSLIM 1 Jul]	23
Law and Order in Balochistan Said Deteriorating /DAWN 5 Jun]	23

### ISLAMIC AFFAIRS

Increase in Islamic Sectarian Conflicts Examined /NIDA-I-KHILAFAT 9 Jun]	25
Government Criticized on Failure To Islamicize /JANG 2 Jun]	26
Islamic Fundamentalist Vision of Nation Assailed /THE MUSLIM 11 Jun]	29
Commentary Condemns Religious Fanaticism /THE MUSLIM 17 Jun]	30

### ECONOMIC

Minister Malik Naeem Khan Announces Trade Policy /THE MUSLIM 1 Jul]	32
Sindh Economy, Development Efforts Viewed	33
Budget Reviewed /JANG 12 Jun]	33
Large-Scale Development To Commence /AMN 17 Jun]	34
Imports Increase 20 Percent in Fiscal 1992-93 /THE NEWS 15 Jul]	35
Federal Budget, Military Expenditures Criticized /NIDA-E-KHILAFAT 25 May]	35

### SOCIAL ISSUES

Bangladeshi Women Bought, Sold Into Slavery /THE MUSLIM 26 Jun]	38
Women Said 'Disadvantaged, Exploited Lot' /DAWN 5 Jun]	40
Women in Custody Said Routinely Tortured, Abused /THE MUSLIM 26 Jan]	42
Rape, Torture, Humiliation of Women Said Commonplace /THE MUSLIM 27 Jun]	43
Continuing Illiteracy Said Harming National Interests /THE MUSLIM 27 Jun]	44

## International Affairs

### Foreign Secretary Responds to Israeli 'Threats'

[Interview With Mohammad Shahrayar Khan, Pakistan's Foreign Secretary, by Zaki Shihab; place and date not given: "Pakistan's Foreign Secretary to AL-WASAT: Arab and Islamic Governments Have Warned Us of Israeli Threats Against Our Nuclear Program"]

[Text] Mohammad Shahrayar Khan, Pakistan's foreign secretary, has expressed his apprehensions about the Israeli threats to strike any Arab or Muslim country that possesses a nuclear program. He has said that Pakistan, which has a nuclear program, deals with these threats "seriously and vigilantly." In the interview, Pakistan's foreign secretary touched on the situation in Afghanistan and expressed the opinion that it is unlikely that this country will be partitioned. Following is the interview with Minister Mohammad Shahrayar Khan:

[Shihab] What is going on in Afghanistan currently and how do you view implementation of the Peshawar accord?

[Khan] After the lapse of 14 years, the fundamental objective for which all the mujahidin factions struggled has been accomplished. Therefore, it can be said now that their struggle to obstruct the intervention of any foreign power in their affairs has ended. The government installed as a result of the Soviet invasion of Afghanistan has been toppled. On the 24th of last April, leaders of the mujahidin factions agreed on a formula for forming a new government. But there continues to be disagreement among the mujahidin leaders on details concerning implementation of the accord concluded in Peshawar. We in Pakistan aspire for implementation of the Peshawar accord as it was announced and as it was concluded by leaders of the well-known factions. But at the same time, we expect that there are some obstacles and disagreements. The important thing which we know is that when an agreement has been concluded among the parties concerned by their consent, then this agreement must be observed, especially since the Peshawar accord was reached by the mujahidin themselves without the intervention of any foreign or non-Afghani party. What is noted in the said accord is that Sibghatullah Mojaddedi, the Provisional Council chairman, shall cede power to Professor Borhanoddin Rabbani and that this shall be followed by the formation of a consultative council and preparation for a general election, and so forth. Mojaddedi has adhered to this accord and has announced that he will give up his position so that Rabbani, the Islamic Association leader, may take over power.

[Shihab] Is there a danger that Afghanistan will be partitioned if the struggle between the various forces isn't ended?

[Khan] Many talk about this issue. It is true that there are various minorities, sects, and ethnic groups in

Afghanistan. But they believe now, as they believed in the past, in their country's unity. I believe it will be the same in the future. The Afghani leaders are fully aware of the danger of partitioning Afghanistan. I see no sign of the presence of such a threat. The Afghans are wise and rational people. They will overcome their small differences and will agree on the major issues. Numerous countries and peoples experience crises. Look at the disagreements among the Algerians, the Lebanese, or the Palestinians. However, there is one agreement that binds all these people, namely eagerness to safeguard the givens. The Afghan people will not waste their great victory to satisfy the ambition of this or that party.

[Shihab] How true is the statement that Golbuddin Hikmatyar, leader of the Hezb-e Islami and your traditional ally, will be ousted from the game if he persists in his well-known position vis-a-vis the other factions?

[Khan] Golbuddin Hikmatyar is one of the prominent Afghan mujahidin leaders. Rather, he is an important leader. But I don't share the belief held by many people that Hikmatyar is the mujahidin leader closest to the Pakistani Government. At one phase of the struggle against the communist regime, Golbuddin's forces were the most organized of the mujahidin factions. But politically, we deal with him as we deal with the other leaders. Hikmatyar's bond to Pakistan developed through his alliance with one of the Pakistani political parties. This has made it difficult for some people to distinguish the bounds of this relationship. At present, we believe that any decision concerning Afghanistan must be made by the Afghani people themselves. Pakistan deals with Afghanistan as an independent and sovereign country. This dealing is different now than when all of them [Afghani factions] were on Pakistani territory, particularly in Peshawar. The Afghani people can adjudge Hikmatyar when he agrees or disagrees with his colleagues. Our belief is that the Peshawar accord gave him the opportunity to assume the premiership and that he has turned it down. If he has done this, then we can do nothing about it. Chairman Sibghatullah Mojaddedi visited Pakistan recently as head of the State of Afghanistan and we received him accordingly. We hope that Hikmatyar will cooperate with the other brother leaders in Kabul.

[Shihab] What are the steps you are taking to repatriate Afghani refugees?

[Khan] They have begun returning to their country at the rate of 40,000 refugees a week. They are present in our country in large numbers. The more stable conditions in Afghanistan become, the more refugees we will repatriate. Realizing such an increase depends in large part on the efforts and programs drafted by the United Nations for this purpose. What is involved is a transportation process that may take between (one year and one and one-half year) at least.

**Nuclear Program and Israel's Threats**

[Shihab] What is Pakistan doing to improve its relations with the United States?

[Khan] Numerous diplomatic activities are ongoing between our two countries. We are going to visit the United States tomorrow (visit has actually taken place). One thing is clear to us, namely that misunderstanding intensified in the period preceding the severance of the U.S. financial aid designated for Pakistan (\$500 million annually). We have now a greater degree of understanding. I hope that the relations will improve, even though the United States has certain positions toward our nuclear program and even though it faults our country for not exerting a serious effort to fight drug muggling and to curtail drug cultivation. But on the political issues, we have greatly similar visions.

[Shihab] What do they want of your nuclear program?

[Khan] They fear that our nuclear program will be converted to military applications. We always insist that we have a clear political decision, namely not to convert the nuclear program to military purposes. It is for peaceful purposes in the areas of energy and research. India, for example, has conducted underground nuclear tests since 1974 but the United States has not subjected it to a limit beyond which it may not go. Meanwhile, the United States demands that it establish for Pakistan certain bounds within which Pakistan is permitted to work while giving India a free hand. This is unfair. We have told the United States that we are prepared to agree to establishing for our nuclear activity limits equal to those permitted India. We haven't exploded anything. So why is the emphasis put on Pakistan? The U.S. officials have realized this faulty position. With this realization, the projection has changed and we have begun talking now about concluding nuclear weapons nonproliferation treaties and about allowing international inspectors to conduct inspections. But we proposed that this be done through an international conference that includes five influential parties. Initially, India turned down the proposal. But it has begun to talk about this issue now, even if in a narrow way, with the purpose of procrastinating, not of developing a solution to which Washington, London, and Paris, as well as Pakistan, agree. We are the party that has declared its acceptance of an international step to regulate the presence of nuclear programs. Yet, we are the ones who get penalized. Meanwhile, India rejects such a step and its rejection goes unchallenged.

[Shihab] Do the Americans link suspension of your nuclear program with resumption of the financial aid?

[Khan] U.S. aid has been withheld from us and given to others. We will not ask for this aid. Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif has said it clearly: We want good relations with the United States. If you restore financial aid, this is good. Else, the issue will change nothing in our country. We will not agree to the imposition of conditions on the activity of our nuclear program. At the same time, we

aspire for good relations. But this will not be at the expense of our country's dignity.

[Shihab] If the Kashmir issue is settled with India, would you be prepared to abandon your nuclear program?

[Khan] It is not a matter of ceding. But if the the Kashmir issue is settled, then we are confident that all other issues will be solved.

[Shihab] The Israeli Air Force commander has warned recently that his country is prepared to strike any Arab or Islamic country that possesses a nuclear program that may pose a threat to Israel's existence. Do you take such threats seriously?

[Khan] We deal with these threats very seriously, alertly, and vigilantly. Our nuclear program poses no threat to any country. However, we have received warnings from several Arab and Islamic countries to tell us to be alert to such Israeli threats. We are aware of these threats and we are aware that India has exchanged diplomatic relations with Israel and that there was cooperation between the two countries even before India recognized Israel.

**Sources Report Peruvian Sale of Mirage-2000's**

92AS1216A London AL-HAYAH in Arabic  
1 Jul 92 pp 1, 4

[Article: "Has Pakistan Acquired Mirage-2000 Fighters From Peru Without France's Authorization?"]

[Text] London—Ambiguity engulfs the fate of 12 French-made Mirage-2000 fighter planes that are supposed to be operating within the ranks of the Peruvian Air Force which had acquired them from Dassault Company in a deal concluded in the early 1980s. There has been speculation about the possibility that the planes were later transferred to another country, namely Pakistan, without an authorization from Paris for the purpose.

What is interesting is that these reports, attributed to military observers concerned with Pakistani affairs and believed to be true by British defense sources, come at a time when there has been increasing talk about the possibility that Pakistan will conclude with France a deal to acquire 60 planes of the kind.

What is also interesting is that there is a link between the earlier deal and BCCI [Bank of Credit and Commerce, International], over whose illegal practices an international clamor continues to brew.

Pakistani sources have said that Peru acquired Mirage-2000's from France in accordance with an agreement which was concluded in 1984 and which provided for sale of 12 aircraft. The first delivery was made in December 1986 and Peru formed Squadron 412 of the Fourth Air Operations Group, stationed in (Lajolla) Air Base, to fly these planes. The planes were actually seen in

the service in the period immediately following their delivery. But they soon disappeared and nothing more was heard about them.

These sources have emphasized that the planes were transferred from Peru to Pakistan in September 1991 in an illegal deal because it had no prior French authorization. The deal was concluded via BCCI which "financed it on behalf of the Pakistani Government, including the payment of vast sums in bribes to a number of high-ranking political and military Peruvian officials." Since then, the planes have been operating within the ranks of the Pakistani Air Force ranks under a shroud of secrecy.

British sources have noted that several considerations make them believe that these reports are true. On the one hand, Pakistan's need for these fighter planes is considered to be urgent. This need has existed for years as a result of the arms embargo the United States imposed on this country on the pretext that it seeks to acquire nuclear weapons. On the other hand, BCCI always had strong relations with the political and military establishment ruling Pakistan. It is plausible that officials in Islamabad asked the bank at the time to mediate in concluding the deal with Peru, especially since the bank had participated in similar transactions in accordance with which Pakistan had acquired weapons and equipment from various international sources. Moreover, British sources assert that the planes had "disappeared" from service in Peru, at least since the onset of the 1990s, and that they had probably been transferred to another country, most likely Pakistan.

It is noteworthy that the disclosure of this information at this time coincides with the large-scale efforts that Pakistan is making to modernize its air forces to counter the threat it feels from India's expanding air force. India has succeeded in strengthening its air force by concluding deals with the ex-Soviet Union, France, and other countries. The most significant aircraft India has acquired are the Soviet-made MiG-29, MiG-27, and MiG-23 and the French-made Mirage-2000.

On the other hand, Pakistan has suffered for years from a lack of sophisticated fighter planes and it only succeeded in the 1980s in getting 40 F-16 Falcon fighters from the United States when ex-President Ronald Reagan's administration decided to lift the embargo temporarily in order to counter the threat posed at the time by the Soviet military presence in Afghanistan. Otherwise, the Pakistani Forces would have continued to rely on Chinese fighter planes that are fundamentally copies of old Soviet planes, such as the F-6 (MiG-19), F-7 (MiG-21) and Mirage-3 and Mirage-5 planes which Islamabad had acquired in the 1960s and 1970s. None of these can match the sophisticated Soviet and French fighters that India possesses.

Pakistan still hopes that Washington will agree to supply it with 60 more F-16 Falcon aircraft. But the possibilities are very small, at least in the foreseeable future. Therefore, Islamabad launched last year negotiations with

France to acquire 60 Mirage-2000 planes instead of the U.S. planes. An agreement between the two countries is plausible, but the negotiations are complicated by financial difficulties that militate against achieving positive end results. Moreover, it is unclear how the disclosure of this information on the transfer of Peruvian planes to Pakistan will, if proven true, affect the official French position toward a prospective deal with Islamabad.

## Internal Affairs

### President Khan Assures Continuity of Nuclear Program

92AS11124 Karachi JANG in Urdu 26 May 92 pp 1,13

[News Story: "We Will Not Stop Nuclear Program Unilaterally—Khan"]

[Text] Islamabad (Special Correspondent)—President Ghulam Ishaq Khan has announced that Pakistan will not stop its nuclear program unilaterally, and at the same time it will not transfer this technology to any other country. He said, "Pakistan believes that every country has the right to acquire nuclear technology for peaceful uses. Pakistan has also made the political decision to use nuclear technology for peaceful purposes. Pakistan has no interest in nuclear weapons and the only purpose of nuclear weapons is that they can help protect us from nuclear attacks. If people are assured of their safety then there will be no need to make nuclear weapons." The president was [speaking at the] Pakistan Institute of Nuclear Science and Technology (PINSTECH) on Monday.

[text missing] "...being punished for what we have not done? The bombs that destroyed Hiroshima and Nagasaki were not manufactured by the 'irresponsible brains' of the Third World countries. It was not a Third World country leader who was cruising in the Augusta and who, on receiving the telegram informing him of the success of the nuclear attack on Japanese city Hiroshima, had said that it was a great development and was time to return home." President Ghulam Ishaq Khan referred to the letter sent by the nuclear scientist Van Nile Bohr to President Roosevelt in which the former had asked him not to use the atomic bomb, and said that this letter was found in Roosevelt's desk after his death. Mr. Roosevelt had not even bothered to open this letter. President Khan said, "I want to explain that the person who could have saved humanity from destruction did not bother to listen to the voice of a person who represented intelligence, sagacity, and peace. Now that the 'horse has escaped the stable, they are guarding the stable gate and trying to close it as if a surgical operation is being conducted there.' They should try to understand that if something has been invented, efforts to ban it totally cannot succeed. You can punish the scientists who invented fire, but the fire will still be there." The president added that Pakistan did not believe in spreading any fires and Pakistan is the first nation that supported the NPT [Nonproliferation Treaty]. "Even

today, we are not behind any other nation in our desire to stop proliferation of nuclear technology. However, we are strongly opposed to the efforts to establish technological 'imperialism' while trying to attain the lofty goal of limiting spread of nuclear weapons." The president said that answer to the problem of controlling nuclear technology is not in hiding the technology but in removing the causes of tension in the world.

### **President Urged To Ignore Pressure Against Nuclear Program**

92AS1112B Karachi JANG in Urdu 27 May 92 p 3

[Editorial: "Right To Benefit From Advanced Technology"]

[Text] President Ghulam Ishaq Khan has said that Pakistan will not stop its nuclear program unilaterally. He was addressing the Silver Jubilee celebration of the Pakistan Institute of Nuclear Science and Technology on Monday and said that expecting Pakistan to abandon its nuclear program in response to the so-called goal of nuclear nonproliferation would be unrealistic and unfair. The president made it clear that Pakistan's nuclear program is peaceful and, because Pakistan supports the concept of nuclear nonproliferation, it will not transfer this technology to any other country.

Pakistan, just like any other developing country, needs to utilize all kinds of modern technologies, including nuclear technology, in order to remedy the serious problem of energy shortage and to make progress in the areas of agriculture, industries, education, and health. The president is right in saying that one should not complain about how knowledge is acquired when it is being used to advance humanity. A point to ponder: If we let a few countries monopolize nuclear technology and other knowledge, then the result would be curbing knowledge and suspending human progress. In addition, allowing a few nations with specific ideologies have monopoly over nuclear technology can result in total destruction of humanity any time, and the whole world has seen the example of such a monopoly in the devastating destruction of Hiroshima and Nagasaki. Therefore, we must agree to end monopolies in any branch of knowledge that help vested interests and encourage development of modern technologies for peaceful uses. President Ghulam Ishaq Khan is perfectly right in saying that if they really want to establish a world order based on love and understanding then they must first broaden their minds. Therefore, it would be very difficult to impose any political, economic, educational, or warlike policy based on extortion, pressure, prejudice, and unfairness at international level.

Pakistan's stand on nuclear technology is so clear and legitimate that no impartial person can object to it. Pakistan believes in peaceful uses of nuclear technology just like any other knowledge. We have demonstrated our broad mind about it both regionally and at the international level. India and other countries spread

baseless rumors about Pakistan's nuclear program. In order to prove that they are lying all we have to do is to refer to the fact that none of these countries is willing to sit down at a table and talk with Pakistan on this issue. Obviously, India is worried most about our nuclear program and it is ridiculous because India already blasted a nuclear bomb in 1974. Pakistan has not done anything in this area at all. India is not willing to allow an international inspection of its nuclear installations. It has not shown a willingness to sign a bilateral agreement with Pakistan. In the past, India used to reject Pakistan's proposals by referring to China's nuclear program. Now Pakistan has proposed holding a conference in which China, Russia, and the United States will be invited to participate. India does not agree with this proposal, either. If a country still objects to Pakistan's nuclear program even after such generous proposals by us, there can be no other meaning for action except that it does not recognize our right to survive as an intelligent and proud nation. Therefore, we have no reason to let it blackmail us and stop our educational progress and social welfare plans. In order to remedy our various problems, we must focus on research and development in nuclear as well as other areas and not let the totally unfair efforts of a specific lobby be a wall in the path of our progress.

### **Atomic Energy Commission Director Resigns**

92AS1117E Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
20 Jun 92 p 1

[Article by Mohammad Yasin: "PAEC Project Director Quits"]

[Text] Islamabad, June 19: Sharp differences among the senior level management cadre of Pakistan Atomic Energy Commission [PAEC] over the proposed purchase of a 300-MW [megawatt] nuclear power plant from China on turnkey basis claimed its first casualty when the Project Director and Incharge of the sensitive project, resigned his post last week, THE MUSLIM learnt from authentic sources.

According to sources, Dr. Syed Bashiruddin Mahmood, the Project Director of the multi-million dollar research and development project, submitted his resignation to the Chairman of the PAEC.

In a letter addressed to the Chairman, he is reported to have said it was no longer possible for him to go along with the PAEC's policy of going for turnkey projects ignoring indigenous development of the needed technologies. "I wish to exercise my option to voluntarily retire from public service under the scheme announced by the government for BPS 21 and 22 officers," Dr. Bashiruddin Mahmood, a senior officer in M-2 grade (BPS 21) said in his letter.

PAEC is yet to take a decision on the resignation. Dr. Mahmood was not available for comments. When contacted at his phone number, THE MUSLIM was informed that he had gone to Murree.

Differences within the top rung of PAEC scientists surfaced about two years ago when the Commission initiated negotiations with China for a 300 megawatt nuclear power reactor. One lobby pleaded that the proposed nuclear reactor contract with China must ensure maximum participation and utilisation of the local manpower and available industrial capability. The other lobby however took the stand that the country's industrial capability had not yet reached a level where it could enter in big way to build a sophisticated nuclear power plant. To this line of thinking, the former lobby rebutted, maintaining if Pakistan could operate the Kahuta research laboratories with the help of available local resources and run a Mirage rebuild factory, it was likewise possible for Pakistan to accept the challenge of building a N-power plant. The lobby took the plea that the Commission had on its own built a complete nuclear fuel cycle complex involving uranium mining, refining and fuel-making. This expertise, the lobby argues, can be pressed into service for building the N-power reactor. The nuclear fuel-making facility has been meeting the fuel needs of the Karachi Nuclear Power Plant [KANUPP] for the last 10 years in the wake of stoppage of the supply of fuel to the KANUPP by Canada in 1976.

The lobby favouring turnkey N-power plant, however, argues that in view of the very high standards of safety required for the manufacture of the nuclear plant, the local industrial infrastructure and manpower cannot deliver the goods. Their strongest argument is that some very vital components of a N-power reactor like electronic controls, high pressure pumps and computer system made by advanced industrial countries are hard to get from the West.

This lobby had its case accepted and Pakistan signed the contract with China for 300 megawatt N-power reactor. This contract envisaged cent percent turnkey project and also import of 2000 unskilled Chinese labour to ensure timely completion of the project. [sentence as published]

The lobby against turnkey project got its chance some weeks ago when it dawned upon the authorities that China might not be able to get vital reactor components from the West because of the embargoes placed on it. It was learnt that China did not make the vital components and in case of strict embargo by the West, the plant construction in Pakistan might not only be delayed but also could be cancelled.

The upshot of the debate on safety measures and heavy reliance on the imported stuff were transfers of a number of senior level management grade officers including some project directors to unimportant posts. The services of a senior cadre officer Dr. S.M. Bhutta have been loaned to the Ministry of Water and Power.

Dr. N.A. Javed and Abdul Majid, who were working on various aspects of nuclear power and fuel cycle, had also been transferred and replaced with technical managers who agreed with PAEC's decision to go for turnkey projects.

### Nation's Leaders Seen Out of Touch With People

92AS1117D Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
9 Jun 92 p 6

[Editorial: "We Could Do Without These Pretenders"]

[Text] Do we have a government? You must be joking. Not one but three governments are running the affairs of the country. First, there is the Parliamentary government of Mian Mohammad Nawaz Sharif, then the Presidential government of Khan Ghulam Ishaq Khan and (take a deep breath) the military government of last resort. Imagine three railway trains running on parallel tracks at full speed, each with its air-conditioned luxury compartments occupied by a privileged few. The people waiting at the wayside station are left wrapped in a cloud of dust and smoke.

There is no doubt that each of these governments is performance-oriented: They want to impress the people that their sole concern is the stability and development of the country. In his largely attended public meetings, so carefully arranged by the Chief Minister of Punjab, the Prime Minister looks like a popular orator willing to lay down his life for the starving masses. He has developed a singular style of talking about himself in the third person. He raises his arms and informs his audience that "Nawaz Sharif loves the poor," that "Nawaz Sharif will never betray the people." He does not relish making statements in the National Assembly. The gossip is that every visit to the Assembly costs him (meaning the public exchequer) at least two crore of rupees with all the applicants and supplicants seeking monetary assistance, jobs and allotments. A remarkably generous person, the Prime Minister rarely visits any locality without showering money on its inhabitants. During his latest sojourn in Sindh, he granted a package of Rupees 5 billion to a strife-torn province run by a non-existent government. The Prime Minister did not pause to explain where the money was going to come from. Would the budget deficit now go up from Rupees 6.5 billion to Rupees 70 billion? Perhaps the Prime Minister is under the impression that all the social and political complaints and grievances of the people of Sindh can be pushed under this five billion rupee carpet.

The Presidential government wears an august look. As a symbol of the Federation, it considers itself above criticism. Yet the Presidential Secretariat likes to act as the eyes and ears of the people. The daily court circulars read like a list of disgruntled politicians, retired military officers, religious leaders and whosoever has an axe to grind, making his way to the Presidential Palace. These wheeler-dealers all try to convince the President that without him the country would be lost.

The government of last resort is waiting in the wings in full uniform—ready to go. As the custodian of the security of the country, the army pretends to have no political aims or ambitions. But every day Pakistan is looking more and more like Thailand. Retired military officers are going into business, politics and journalism

and before long all political parties will come under the patronage or control of some former General, Admiral or Air Marshal.

The political life of the country is dominated by stories and rumours of misunderstandings, tensions and conflicts between the three governments. But there is a tacit agreement among the three on one point: Each must retain full control over its own patch. All three detest the Press. If only newspapers would stop reporting unpleasant news there would be no problem in the country. It is beginning to look like action replay of the sordid events of the 1950s. The only difference is that the army which was hailed as a "saviour" in 1958, now has a highly questionable political record and the people have little confidence in its ability to resolve the problems of the country. Already its operation in Sindh is running into trouble. What the country needs is one effective representative government, not three pretenders to power.

#### **Sindh: Ameliorating Attitude Recommended to Army**

92AS1158B Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
17 Jun 92 p 6

[Article by Humayun Akhtar: "For Sindh: A Dream That May Come True"]

[Text] It is indeed satisfying to note that at last the authorities in Islamabad have realised the gravity of situation in the province of Sindh. The army backed crack-down is in full swing. The President, the Prime Minister, the Minister of Interior, Chief of the Army Staff and all those who matter have visited Karachi and some of them even Hyderabad and other cities in the interior.

Prime Minister Mohammad Nawaz Sharif, during his first visit on the eve of launching of the Army action did not mince his words and was frank to pinpoint the inefficiency of the Sindh Police. Let us hope that this does not create ripples in the Police against the Prime Minister.

It is certainly a good omen that, for a change, authorities are calling a spade a spade. This is what was needed. The political parties of the province are also supporting the Army action, so long it remains evenhanded. The Corps Commander's luncheon, given in honour of the Prime Minister, was attended by the PPP [Pakistan People's Party] provincial leadership and MQM [Muhajir Qaumi Movement] both. It is a change for the better and it seems that adversity is bringing security and maturity in our politics. Let us hope that this continues.

Today the Pakistan Army is on test. One hopes that they will come out of this with flying colours; regaining their respect and image amongst the people of the province. In fact, it is Allah's given chance to the Army to prove their mettle. Much will depend on their other ranks and

officers leading them, who will be on the streets and in villages; in touch with the common man.

One hopes that the Army personnel will:

not come out with a jaundiced eye to teach a lesson. They will remember the cardinal principle of law, that a person is not guilty unless so proven in a court of law; he is called 'accused' and not a criminal till so adjudged after a free and fair trial.

—remember that all the Pakistanis, irrespective of caste and creed, colour and religious affinities and position in life—poor or rich—are respectable citizens and will be treated so.

—be careful when coming in contact with the womenfolk and will treat them as their own mothers and sisters.

—not only eradicate dacoits and unlawful elements but also help whenever it is needed and possible, may be by providing medical aid, etc. if so available and possible.

—not hob-nob with local gentry and waderas; accepting their parties and favours will create problems.

—be firm but just; a model of discipline but kind as they will be dealing with their own country folk.

Indeed the Army Jawans will be operating under a very delicate and critical situation. They will be confronted with hostility, suspicion and mistrust. They will encounter enemy agents working in the guise of patriotic Pakistanis, at times they will be working at the peril of their lives.

It will not be a normal warlike operation where the enemy is known and the rules of the game are well defined. It would not be incorrect to say that most of the time it will be like groping in the dark, not knowing who is who—friend or enemy.

A slight faux pas here and an error of judgement there will create an uproar. They will have to be extremely careful in their dealings, remembering that a hasty decision will create problems. Raid on Makhdooms and arrest of APMSO [All Pakistan Mohajir Students Organization] people at Karachi by Rangers were hardly a start on the correct foot. Such incidents create doubts in rank and file of the affected party. To announce the arrest of the people after a chase of those who were alleged to be in possession of arms and ammunition and then to leave them scot free, maybe on bail, is only indicative of either weakness or that the action was not justified. To err is human, but errors en masse are not conducive to confidence building.

Today, we are passing through a rather critical phase of our national life. We can make it or mar it. This is the chance for our Army to turn a new page in the history of Pakistan. By their actions they can win the hearts of people of Sindh. They could justifiably be called saviours, which they are, of the country.

People of the province are really fed up with lawlessness and insecurity. They went to lead a peaceful and happy life; and not a life where they are not such as to what is going to happen to them or their kith and kin the next moment; where a mother or a wife is not sure if she is going to greet her son or husband alive or wail over his dead body.

People have lost faith; in whom to believe. What they are told and what actually happens, are poles apart. Let us hope that for a change Army Public Relations will show the path of wisdom to our mis-Information authorities. People will be told the truth and nothing but the truth, however, unpalatable it may be for the authorities. For a change, let us hope, people will not be forced to tune to BBC or VOA to know about the happenings in their country or believing in rumours; but will await ISPR [Inter-Service Public Relations] press releases on PTV and Radio Pakistan to know the truth. ISPR should also take media into confidence: the media is as patriotic as authorities in the mis-Information Dept.

The task is difficult but not insurmountable. What is needed is honesty of purpose and effort and dispensing of justice, which should be blind and not delayed. Let us hope that after the elapse of six months, normalcy will return to the province and when the Army units withdraw, people will bid them farewell with heavy heart and tearful eyes. Such would not be an unexpected or a novel happening. In East Pakistan, when Lt. Gen. Azam Khan was relieved of his duties as the Governor, the populace had wailed and sobbed and had said goodbye to him in an unprecedented show of love and affection.

Then there was Admiral Ahsan who when Governor of the then East Pakistan, was also respected by all and sundry. In 1970, during the finals of the Agha Khan Gold Cup at Paltan Maidan, when he walked to the centre of the ground for the prize-giving ceremony, the whole crowd gave him a standing ovation; it was just unbelievable. In March 1971, when he got the sack for intimating Islamabad the true situation, crowds of Bengalis chanting "Admiral Ahsan Na Javey," had surrounded the Governor House and Admiral Ahsan had to be whisked away by helicopter.

Bodily people may be chained and tortured or kept behind bars, but their minds and thoughts cannot be subjugated or enslaved. People of the then East Pakistan did not want secession, they wanted their rights, they wanted justice and fair play, and these were not to be given to them. It was our actions that forced them to go into the lap of the enemy. Actions of some of us were nothing but abominable, a slur on humanity, a disgrace for persons who call themselves Muslim.

Gen. Azam Khan and Admiral Ahsan did not go for popularity; they were firm and tough men but fair and just and meant business. They were honest. East Pakistanis loved them then and Bangladeshis still remember them with all fondness—"Azam Bandhoo" is still revered. Let there be welcome shouts of, "Sain Nawaz

Sharif and Sain Nawaz Janjua," when they visit the province after six months. It can happen.

What is needed is justice and honesty, people should not be taken for a ride or considered idiots. The recent Shahbander episode is again an Allah-given chance for the Prime Minister to show to the people of the province that nobody is above law. A story was published in a local newspaper that the Prime Minister's Joint Investigation Team has confirmed that the alleged terrorists on the boat alleged to be going to India were not armed and that seven alleged terrorists were killed without any armed encounter and that the "Naval Officer who conducted the briefing did not tell the truth."

How come the ISPR was bypassed and why was the incident publicised in a manner that only shows thirst for publicity? Why? People should be taken to task for dereliction of duties, however, high and mighty they may be. In fact, the handling of the incident smacks of lapses in character qualities. Who is going to trust whom? A similar sort of incident happened near Jamshoro and the Corps Commander briefed the PM [Prime Minister] about it. It was again a mismanaged affair, a hasty step, without going into details and facts. Why? Is there an effort to malign our Armed forces by hidden hands? Who passed the initial information to the Army? Let us beware, our rank and file is teeming with enemy agents. All possible efforts are being made to create problems for the law-enforcing agencies—by misguiding and by passing incorrect reports etc. Our media should also be careful and avoid sensationalism or publishing of unverified news.

During the last provincial regime, AZO [Al-Zulfikar Organization] was the whipping horse. Let us not act in a way where people may start having sympathetic attitude towards AZO. Culprits must be punished but according to the laws of the country. One-upmanship hunger for publicity and awards should not be the main motives. We are dealing with politically conscious people and not dummies. On the other hand, we Pakistanis must understand that there shall be an Army in the country, be it ours or the enemy's. Let us pray to Allah for the success of Pak Armed Forces.

#### Articles View Consequences of Military Action in Sindh

##### Only Removing Symptoms

92ASJ2044 Karachi: DAWN in English 17 Jun 92 p 9

[Article by I.A. Rehman: "Pitfalls and Dangers in Sindh"; quotation marks as published]

[Text] (Four books came from the heavens, the fifth one was the rod; despite the four books man was not reformed, he responded only to the rod)—Seraik/Sindhi folk saying which is reflected in the attitude of tough rulers as well as of those rising against them.

The die seems to have been cast. An operation has been launched in Sindh which fills most people with grave apprehensions. The reason is that the action is based on a false assumption that lawlessness in Sindh has undermined civil life and the administration's functioning. In reality lawlessness in Sindh, as anywhere else at any time, is the result of the breakdown of authority and the rules of civil management.

The outlaws are not the primary cause of Sindh's ordeal; they have only been exploiting a state of anarchy caused by misgovernance and complicated by a deep-rooted socio-economic-political malaise. Once again Authority seems to have ignored the dangers in treating effect as cause.

Sindh is viewed as a land taken over by outlaws. This is not incorrect but it is only one part of the truth. It will not be possible to evolve an appropriate strategy to restore normality without a comprehensive diagnosis of Sindh's many afflictions. It is a society in which practically all sections have been driven to devices of the last resort by a groundswell of discontent generated by a variety of factors. Some of these must be taken into account:

—The people of Sindh have been subjected to the worst form of wadera-shahi in the country.

This province has had the highest chief minister mortality rate.

—Of the five prime ministers sacked by the heads of state three belonged to Sindh (as against one from Punjab).

—Sindh has not only recorded the highest immigrant-population ratio, to the extent that the indigenous population fears loss of its ethnic-cultural-linguistic identity; it has also been made to give up to settlers from within the country more of its land and other resources than any other province.

—Nowhere in Pakistan have non-Muslims faced so many hazards as in Sindh, for daring to stay on in their homeland.

—Sindh has the highest graduate-population ratio in the country and also the highest rate of the educated unemployed.

And Sindh has suffered more frequent operations than any other province by security forces in which its representation remains minimal.

These factors of discontent have given rise to some specific beliefs, policies and attitudes, and concepts of legality, justice and resistance, which have erased the line between law and lawlessness and brought Sindh to the present pass. It is in this context that the nature and extent of Sindh's law and order problem should be examined.

No part of Sindh, nor any section of its population, has been safe from the depredations of the outlaw. Wanton killing, kidnapping for ransom, car-lifting, child-snatching, gang-rape, extortion, and private vendetta have been widely reported from both urban and rural areas. Many incidents falling in these categories have not been reported and much else that happens, especially in the countryside, is not considered worth reporting at all.

The rural population has suffered more than the urban because it does not have the protection of even the tattered administration the latter has. In villages the constant fear of something ghastly happening any time has caused more harm and distortion in the pattern of life than the actual incidents of lawlessness. In a climate of unrelieved terror nobody can think of tomorrow. The shopkeeper is every moment afraid of a visitor flashing a gun or support his peremptory demand.

Entry and exit points in villages have been reduced to one or two and freedom of movement drastically restricted. Everybody is ordered indoors hours before sunset. School children cannot go to playgrounds outside village limits. Any man of means must have a heavily armed escort all the time. Throughout the night gunmen stay perched on high points with searchlights on in many places.

Forced to stay in their hovels longer than they like, most villagers spend time recounting the raw deal they have been having for decades. For centuries the *hari* wanted to have a piece of land for himself. "It was hard to give up that dream," says the 70-year-old *kumdar*, "but we accepted our fate and started sending our boys to school, that is, where the wadera did not object." The old man educated all four of his sons. Then began a long struggle to find jobs for them. Nobody helped them. Ultimately he had to pay Rs 10,000 to 12,000 to secure a teacher's job for each boy. Now they teach in nearby villages. Every evening the old man has nightmares until the sons are back home. Thousands of stories like this. But this one chosen because the people involved have been voting for top-ranking politicians who became not only ministers but also prime ministers.

It is not necessary to talk to anyone to realise what the spectre of violence and disorder has done to Sindh. Only a short distance out of Karachi on the Super-highway one finds at every few kilometres newly-built double-storey police posts, with entrance on the ground barred by iron gates and gun-holes in the balcony wall. Almost 150 years after the policeman came out of the castle to deal with the outlaw in the open the minions of authority want to retreat into castles, leaving the open ground to the criminal.

At almost each petrol station (out of the few that are still functioning) or factory by the roadside towers for armed guards have been built by owners. Many things have lost their meanings. There are abandoned railway tracks where no train has run for quite some time. Vast fields

from the 1960 election, the government has been unable to implement its policies.

The new budget shows the Nationalist Government's failure to fulfil its promise to return power with democracy to Rhodesia. There has been little change in the existing system of rule, which is still highly centralized. The laws for nationalization have been strengthened, and the government continues to control virtually all aspects of the economy. It is clear that the policies of the former régime are still in force.

Although South Africa is now more liberal than it was in previous years, there is still a strong feeling among many African people that the government is not doing enough to improve their living conditions and provide them with opportunities for education and employment. The very low rate of inflation is the main reason why the cost of living has not risen significantly in recent years. However, it is the lack of development of services and infrastructure which is the main cause of the poor quality of life that exists in most parts of the country.

There is much evidence that in recent times, the white government has gone back to its old policies.

South Africa's foreign policy has changed over the last few years, reflecting the shift in the balance of power between the United States and the Soviet Union. The US has become the dominant power in the world, and the Soviet Union has lost its influence and influence. This has led to a change in South Africa's attitude towards its neighbours, particularly the United States. It is now seeking closer ties with the US, and is trying to increase its influence in the world by supporting other countries and maintaining a presence in the region.

The first year of independence saw a significant change in this situation. A new government, under the leadership of Dr. Ian Smith, replaced the old colonial government, and a new constitution was adopted. This included a new constitution, which gave greater powers to the black majority, as well as the establishment of a new government. This new government focused on issues such as racial equality, and racial integration, but ignored the needs of the black majority. The new government also focused on the welfare of the black majority, permanent citizens, and the black majority, permanent citizens, who only wanted the status of a black citizen. They will not tolerate any racism.

The type of racism seen in Africa during the era of apartheid is still prevalent today. The white minority's claim has been acknowledged, and they are looking to strengthen their grip on power. This includes a large proportion of black people, who have been driven from their homes after failing to get employment, and many others who have stayed at home, a situation that continues to affect millions of people in Africa. It has been joined by African leaders, who are fighting for the return of land. And there is a whole new breed of racists, mainly in the north. The example of the state of

Rhodesia has set off a new chapter in the history of South Africa, with a strong emphasis on democracy and freedom of speech.

### Political Parties Needed

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

It is clear that the current political situation in South Africa is not sustainable, and a new political party is needed.

bottom, and added to several other sets of seeds obtained at great depths. The results of the experiments indicate that the seeds from the bottom were able to germinate in water no deeper than 20 cm., while the seeds from the surface germinated at 40 cm. The results of the germination experiments are given in the following table:

Practitioners presented a wide variety of views on the concept of the problem patient. Some claimed that the problem patient was the one who violated the norms of the society. The majority of them, however, believed that the problem patient was a person who had difficulty in adapting to his/her environment. Some practitioners also claimed that the problem patient was a person who had difficulty in adapting to his/her environment.

But given as they are now in Russia, including the one of you and mine, a fundamental political situation that seems change in itself, and therefore, I think, a general situation of government and people, which is not to be expected.

and the results of which were published in a number of articles.

Finally, government can reduce its contribution to climate change by shifting away from fossil fuels towards cleaner energy sources. This can be achieved through various policy instruments such as subsidies, taxes, and regulations. The shift to renewable energy sources like wind and solar power can help reduce greenhouse gas emissions and combat climate change.

© 2010 Pearson

John G. Clegg, *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law*, Vol. 25, No. 1, January 2000, pp. 1-30.

Journal of Child Welfare, Vol. 30, No. 1, March 1982

With regard to the new sort of book that  
you propose to publish, I am inclined to think  
that it would be well to have the author's name  
on the title page, as it will be a  
considerable help in getting the book published.

The results of the study are presented in Table 1. The mean age of the patients was 41 years and the mean age of the controls 31 years. There were no significant differences between the two groups in terms of sex, marital status, education, income, or employment.

These findings were consistent with previous reports. The absence of a significant effect of the exercise intervention on the physical activity levels of the participants is in agreement with a recent study by Biddle et al. (2009).

In one experiment with a large number of entries from the first 1000 entries, 62% could be identified as being associated with filled-in and modified and/or "unfilled" or "unmodified" in all entries at the maximum. Thus, this almost guarantees a unique entry. So a unique identifier may well be available if the entries all return to the same place.

In all major operations necessitating the army's deployment, to 'restore the writ of the government', the commander and the force under him were equipped not only with the powers required to control and normalise the situation but also be indemnified for action taken to achieve the given objective.

Off-hand I can recall Operations Jute, Operation Service First and Operation Close Door—all in former East Pakistan in the early and mid-fifties. While these operations lasted, civilian authority stayed in a sort of suspended animation and, for all practical purposes, at the beck and call of the army commander.

**Operation Close Door**, the largest and the longest military operation launched in aid of civilian power (1957-58), GOC, 14 Infantry Division, (Dhaka) Major General Umrao Khan, enjoyed full control and use of the entire civil-military state apparatus. For all his sins of omission and commission he reported only to the superior headquarters (GHQ) and, through it, to the Centre. While the operation lasted his authority remained absolute, and unchallenged in a court of law after it was all over.

In West Pakistan, the army (or rather the armed forces) was deployed on a much larger scale in situations of mass uprisings, and insurgencies in addition to the three general martial laws, three wars, and countless border skirmishes and ceasefire violations, all waged from West Pakistan.

In every such contingency the army was given absolute authority while the situation lasted and assured of indemnity once the decks were cleared.

Balochistan has perhaps known more military interventions than any other province. Even at the birth of the new country, military force had to be used to make the Khan of Kalat see the patent folly of declining to accede to Pakistan; then again in 1958, 1964 and finally in 1973-77 through what turned out to be the only guerrilla insurgency (or war?) in Pakistan's history under the democratic government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto.

The Frontier province had known military intervention, in local and trans-border contingencies for times without number.

None of the contingencies recounted above involved resort to martial law, and were, therefore, handled without supplanting civilian authority. Under martial law such as in Lahore (1953) and the country (1958, '69 and '77) the question of civilian authority would not arise at all. It would be naked military rule all the way.

In Sindh, happily, the situation has not, as yet, taken so ugly a turn as to necessitate recourse to sterner measures like the imposition of Governor's rule or an outright imposition of martial law. All the same, the army is all over the place charged with the task of restoring the writ of the government.

It is a most formidable task; and the army is supposed to accomplish it without either desecrating the political temple or penetrating the administrative *sanctum sanctorum*.

Like a kimono, the army is supposed to cover everything without touching anything. How Commander, 5 Corps, goes about his job remains to be seen.

### Sindhi Press Sees Shortcomings

92AS1204D Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
27 Jun 92 p 4

[Article by Azizur Rahman Buglio: "Government's Reluctance To Recognise Realities Criticised"; quotation marks as published]

[Text] Unlike the national press, the Sindhi Press, reflective of the feelings of the people of Sindh is not at all shocked and surprised at the exposure of Muhajir Qaumi Movement's [MQM] misdeeds and excesses against humanity in the torture cells now laid bare by the Army action in Karachi. They were known to the Sindhis who had gone through the tortuous life at various stages of the coming into being of this ethnic organisation. But what has actually shocked and pained them is the reluctance on the part of the IJI Government to call spade a spade and adopt an honourable course to disown "this dangerous and fascist group" which continues to share the rule at federal as well as at the provincial level.

From the very first day of its creation during Zia's dictatorial regime, the people of Sindh were aware about the designs of MQM [Muhajir Qaum Movement], as it never made a secret of what it had in mind. Later, under a strong official patronage, this group made quick moves of entry into political life of the country, winning elections through sheer tactics of terror, victimisation and black-mail. Calling themselves Muhajir after 45 years stay was deliberately a dangerous development aimed at refusing to establish an honest contact with and merge among the people they were around. Insistence on and assertion of separate entity on the basis of cultural exclusiveness prompted them to adopt methods and manners distinct and different from the people eventually resulting in maintaining distance from the rest of the population. They did not realise that this attempt of 'distance-keeping' from the people would ultimately distance and deprive them of developing close association with and genuine involvement in the land they had their abodes on. That was to give them much-needed identity in the new environment and amalgamate them into the whole. But that natural course was not adopted with the result that they drifted away towards aloofness and irrelevance. Detached from the locals and the land, they, today, stand on political plank with no relevance to realities on the ground and hence their present problems.

But in the wake of the present exposure of MQM, the Federal Government is losing whatever moral ground it had to keep this partner in politics in tact, without coming out clear from the present political mess. The

decision to send a fact-finding committee to Karachi when the facts are before the eyes of all after the unearthing of torture cells and mass-registration of FIRs against the leadership of this group, reflects reluctance not to recognise realities and by-pass the eye-opening events. This strategy seems to be a delaying tactic to gain time for MQM 'Haqiqi' to stand on the debris and destruction of MQM 'Haq Parast', so that the present unholy partnership in political game goes undisturbed and no need is felt to accommodate the demands for a truly representative government in Sindh.

It is this deliberate attempt to continue ruling this province from Islamabad that has annoyed the Sindhi Press which finds no difference between the two warring groups of MQM. Almost all the dailies are filled with statements, reactions, assessments and editorials to display the fear, anger and anxiety of the people of Sindh following Army crack-down on Karachi. The Ibrat (21/6), The Hilal-i-Pakistan, Awami Awaz and Jago (23/6) have editorially demanded clear cut action warranted by the events in Karachi, doing justice to both the wrong-doers and the wronged, with criminals in the dock and the innocent and the suffering people treated with sympathy and solution they deserve.

The Awami Awaz fails to understand the official partiality shown to the MQM leadership in shape of protection given to them in the face of unearthing of torture centres of this very group shown officially to the media representatives. The paper points out the anomaly of registration of FIRs [First Information Reports] of murders against MQM Chief, on one hand and Prime Minister's meetings with him as a brother, on the other. The paper asks if this official attitude of sympathy and respect to Mr Altaf Husain renders the government a partner in the crime and inheritor of the torture camps.

The Jago, in this connection, doubts if proper notice of MQM's misdeeds would be taken in the present environment of official political patronage extended to this group which stands naked, following Army action in Karachi, although this is the best occasion to root out the real cause of political instability and remedy the dangerous situation in Sindh. The paper warns the government against its "role and responsibility in the present state of fascism lawlessness waywardness and frustrations whose one reflection is MQM." The state and its other characters are responsible for the present plight of the people and democracy in the country. What for the people are being avenged, asks the paper. As a part of this conspiracy, the paper thinks the Martial Law was imposed in 1977 to deprive the people of their basic rights and all this in the name of Islam, including emergencies, Zia's referendum, partyless elections, war in Afghanistan, etc.

The paper maintains that this entirely is anti-country situation and demands "a comprehensive remedy before this country-wide hostility assumes dangerous proportion bringing a catastrophe on us all, never to be able to come out from."

Again, the same daily (24/6) feels something fishy about "the discovery of a very small quantity of weapons in Karachi where there are Kalashnikovs in lakhs." The paper demands "to see complete end of terrorism. Nothing less than that is acceptable to us. If the known criminals withdraw from the traditional terrorism of MQM, how can they be pardoned?"

The paper suspects that "the new political situation emerging as a result of the Army operation seems to be a part of new conspiracy. If the criminals of MQM were to be newly organised and were enabled to seek pardon by joining the rebel group, then others can excuse them but not the Sindhis who, being makers of Pakistan and now its genuine defenders do not want to see any shelter for terrorists criminals and those with FIRs against them. "We are not prepared to praise a doubtful justice." According to the paper, "Sindhis are a nation with whom either open enmity or open friendship could be done and there is no third thing in their history allowing hypocrisy acceptable to them."

The paper warns those busy re-organising MQM that this will not do because it is harmful not to Sindh but to democracy and ultimately to Pakistan also.

The Awami Awaz (24/6) wants to know how those leaving Altaf Husain could become angels by merely joining hands with Aamer and Bader Iqbal and if they will be tried on the basis of the registered cases against them. The paper also wants to know if one MQM will be finished and another brought in its place. "If it is so, then all the dacoits will not lag behind and will offer their support to Syed Muzaffar Hussain Shah. Then, will the government and the operation authorities accept this position and pardon the culprits," argues the paper. The paper demands setting-up of a special tribunal to probe into the alleged "misdeeds of this terrorist and foreign agent organisation."

### Economic Rehabilitation Needed

92AS1204E Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
27 Jun 92 p 6

[Article by S. Ahmed: "New Questions After Army Action in Sindh"; first paragraph is THE MUSLIM comment]

[Text] The army has crushed what was its own offspring in Sindh but S. Ahmed thinks the military gains may be squandered unless the Centre is ready with a political and economic rehabilitation package after the first phase of army action is over.

A militant political party with an ethnic label sponsored by the military rulers has ultimately been crushed by the army itself to the glee of many elements in Karachi and even more in the interior of Sindh.

The question asked now is: Can the Mohajir Qaumi Movement [MQM] rise again and hit back? But the army

has hit it so hard and is taking no chances in respect of its survival in the previous dreaded form, it can't rise again right now.

A counter product of the 1983 MRD [expansion not given] Movement, which was more successful in Sindh than elsewhere, the MQM was built up by Gen Zia to arrest the tendency of Mohajirs, who then called themselves new Sindhis, and the old Sindhis coming together after two decades of estrangement or hostility to each other. He sought to divide Sindh in such a manner that two major groups in it would be pitted against each other instead of turning against him jointly.

Gen Zia created the MQM also as counter to the Jamiat-i-Islami with which he had become disillusioned by then and did not like its militancy as reflected in the menacing postures of the Jamaat-e-Tuleba and the ideological stridency of the Jamaat which then tried to pose as the sole custodian of Islam.

In an extremely absurd and short-sighted manner Mr. G.M. Syed also collaborated in the birth of the MQM in the hope it would drive the Punjabis and Pathans out of Sindh, particularly rural Sindh where they owned vast lands. After the MQM had driven out others, the Sindhis were to fix the MQM which by then would have become weakened, in his reckoning.

But ultimately what was created as a handy political tool in the hands of Gen Zia turned to be a veritable tiger claiming to speak on behalf of all the Mohajirs in Sindh and brooking no opposition to it from Mohajirs and to a large extent from others.

And now, while the chief of the MQM Altaf Hussain has been in London for the last four months, the party has been smashed in Karachi with the Vice-President Saleem Shahzad too arrested, and murder and other major cases against many leaders including Altaf Hussain.

The army has opened four centres in Karachi to register cases against the MQM and hundreds of cases have been filed against the MQM by its victims whose FIRs were not as registered by the police as long as the MQM was in power in Sindh. Many of the charges are very serious.

Four of the MQM MNAs [members of national assembly] have deserted the party and joined the dissidents headed by Afaq Ahmad, Amir Khan and Badr Iqbal, former Sindh Transport Minister, and some number of MQM MPAs [members of provincial assembly] have also deserted their party.

Rumours have it that the invisible chairman of the MQM Azim Tariq will also join the rebels. But he has denied it, and berated the rebels. But strikingly no case had been filed against him in the complaint centres or the police stations until Wednesday when this is being written. Which way the moderate MQM Speaker of the Sindh Assembly Abdul Raziq Khan will go remains to be seen.

Normally the MQM should have left the coalition government in Sindh headed by Mr. Muzaffar Shah as well as from the Centre, where it has two Ministers. But it is not taking such a step for fear that if their ministers leave the government in Sindh and at the Centre they may be hit harder.

Such a stance on its part is understandable as the party's birth was sponsored by the government and it has been in the government or close to it except in the brief period after it left the PPP [Pakistan People's Party] government in Sindh.

Out of the nine persons killed since the army action started on Friday, only five are MQM activists but the number of activists arrested is said to be 50 out of the total of 545 persons arrested since Friday.

Surprisingly the army has not moved into Hyderabad which is the second MQM stronghold in Sindh. Will that strike come as a part of the army action in the interior of Sindh? Mayor Aftab Ahmad Shaikh is known to have differences with Mr Altaf Hussain for a long time now. Which way will he go now?

Meanwhile the torture chambers or cells set up by the MQM, beginning with an infamous one in the Lines Area, are being exposed one after another spotlighting the terrible method employed by MQM.

The PPP is happy to see the crack-down on the MQM as it has been its fiercest enemy opposed to any kind of power-sharing between IJI-PPP in Sindh. The army action has been openly or tacitly welcomed by the PPP. If the MQM is finally eliminated the PPP's major challenger to power in Sindh will vanish.

While a large number of people welcome the objective of the army action, they do not approve of the methodology employed. Surely if the army came to end lawlessness, it should not have enabled the dissidents, whom it has been protecting so far, to occupy the MQM offices, including the main office at Al Karam Square. Nor would it have encouraged or permitted the dissidents to take ou' victory processions one after another.

But the fact is that the MQM's normal terror machine could not have been eliminated through the common electoral or political process. The MQM had too strong a hold on its areas and others were not permitted to break in. So the army has been trying to correct one wrong with another, using first the MQM dissidents to create ground for the army to move in.

But it appears that it was not only the MQM which had torture cells in Karachi. The Punjabi-Pathan Ittehad leader Ghulam Sarwar Awan, a former cop, is also said to have had his own torture cell. The army is looking for him. The army had last year exposed various frauds he had committed to make a great deal of money and yet he was not arrested, tried and punished.

In such a context the departure of Mr. Irfan Marwat, Adviser to the Chief Minister on Home, and now on

Health, along with his has given rise to a spate of rumours. Newspapers have begun reporting some of his misdeeds. It has now been said that an agent of his Gulzareen, a former Sub-inspector, used to collect Rs 30,000 and more for jobs for doctors in the government. The crimes of the CIA personnel which are being unearthed now, would also rebound on him as he had brought his cousin Samiullah Marwat as D.I.CIA. And the Adviser used to spend a lot of time in the CIA office. Such exposure of Mr. Marwat would reflect adversely on President Ghulam Ishaq Khan who is his father-in-law.

What has taken place so far in Karachi is only Act I of the five act play. Act II will be the action in the interior of Sindh. Will the PPP and other political parties in the interior of Sindh who are quietly or openly hailing the army action do the same when the army strikes equally decisively in the interior of the province?

Will the MPAs from the interior of Sindh then support Mr. Mazaffar Shah or revolt against him and dump him? Abandoned by the MQM and other MPAs backing him hitherto, where will he stand? If he loses his majority support and no one within the ruling coalition has majority support, the constitutional alternative is not Governor's rule, but asking the PPP to form the government if it has a majority. And if the PPP is asked to form the government will it be able to command a majority? But it will not be asked to form the government.

Instead what the Sindh government may have is suspension of the Provincial Assembly for six months, the period in which the army action is to be conducted initially on a sustained basis. If instead the Assembly is dissolved and Governor's Rule is imposed on the province, elections would have to be held within 90 days. That could mean a PPP victory which Islamabad wants to avoid at all cost. So does the MQM even after it has been bartered.

The problem now for Islamabad is to have a government or democratic set-up in Sindh keeping out the first and second largest parties in Sindh. And that is a tough or impossible act. Many violations of the spirit of the Constitution will be committed in the process.

Will the MQM Haqeeqi Group supplant the MQM Haq Parast Group? If it does how large it ultimately turns out to be remains to be seen. But the powers that be will take care that the new MQM will not become a menace like the old one. Anyway, enough number of cases have already been filed against its leaders and so they have to be wary of them.

Any kind of MQM without gates or fortresses will not be the kind of dreaded party it was. The army is hence focusing on removing all those gates, beginning with the Lines Area to which the police and the Rangers had hardly any access until recently.

After all the criminal and most extreme elements, both in urban and rural Sindh, have been levelled down, prosecuted and punished, what next? How to prevent the

rebirth and ascendancy of militant parties? The economic problems of the province, particularly massive unemployment, will have to be solved. There has to be large scale investment and real economic growth. Without such massive rehabilitation work the military gains may be squandered in the political and economic void. So the Centre has to be ready with the rehabilitation package to come into force soon after the first phase of the army action is over.

### President Responsible

924S1204F Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
26 Jun 92 p 6

[Editorial: "The President Owes an Explanation"]

[Text] THE PAKISTAN TIMES, a government-controlled newspaper, has reported that a joint investigative team is carrying out a probe into the assets of Mr Irfanullah Marwat, son-in-law of the President and Advisor to Sindh government. The Veena Hyat rape case in which Mr Marwat was allegedly involved has been re-opened and enquiries are also being made into certain other accusations relating to misuse of official position and other irregularities (June 25). A couple of days ago, it was reported that Mr Marwat had left the country for a brief sojourn in Europe after obtaining leave of absence from the Chief Minister of Sindh.

During the Senate debate on June 24, Senator Iqbal Haider stated that President Ghulam Ishaq Khan had facilitated Mr Marwat's departure from the country, and it was in the President's car that he was taken to the Islamabad airport. Mr Iqbal Haider also claimed that army action against certain elements in the Punjabi-Pukhtoon Ittehad suspected of involvement in terrorist acts was delayed to enable Mr Marwat to make good his escape. This had put a question mark against operation clean-up. When Mr Iqbal Haider was making these insinuations and accusations, the House was listening to him in pin-drop silence. None of the Federal Ministers, and at least six of them were present for a change, nor any member of the ruling party raised any objection or offered any clarification. The reflection cast by the Senator on the President evoked no protest whatever.

We know that the government does not have much time for the press, but when such serious accusations are made against the Head of State by a Senator, some explanation, some clarification is necessary to allay the misgivings of the people. When scores of people, against whom enquiries are in progress, have been put on the exit-control list, why was an exception made in the case of Mr Marwat? If an official has a persistent reputation of being corrupt or immoral, it is ground enough for his dismissal. Mr Marwat certainly enjoys such a reputation and he owes it to himself and to his father-in-law to face the enquiry that has been ordered against him. Disappearing from the scene only puts a suspect in a vulnerable position.

Unfortunately, the President, too, has been put in an awkward situation. There are various questions which are troubling the minds of the people, and he alone can answer them. He has to tell the people about his attitude regarding the conduct of his son-in-law in successive governments in Sindh. It is widely believed that the President has been exercising complete control on the affairs of Sindh, and it was with his approval and encouragement that Jam Sadiq Ali pursued a calculated policy aimed at the suppression of the People's Party. The late Jam Sadiq Ali made no secret of his loyalty to the President and considered himself accountable to none other than the President. The President himself expressed on more than one occasion, complete satisfaction with the law and order situation in Sindh under the Jam regime. It is difficult to believe that the President, who considers himself authorised to question any decision taken by the government and receives reports from all intelligence agencies, was unaware of the real situation in Sindh. Why was he telling the people that with the elimination of the Benazir Bhutto government, things had returned to normal? Was he not aware of the draconian measures that Jam Sadiq Ali was adopting to destroy the administration in the province?

It is also known that the President has maintained close contacts with the MQM, particularly its godfather, Mr Altaf Hussain. Did the President know that the MQM [Muhajir Qaum Movement] had established a network of torture cells in parts of Karachi and that the Federal and provincial governments had become willing tools in the hands of the organisation?

Sindh was teetering on the verge of collapse when operation clean-up was ordered. Did the President, who had made the province his special concern (if not his fief) observe the steady slide of the province toward chaos? After all, his own son-in-law was in charge of law and order and he must have kept him informed of the developments. The suspicion is that the President not only knew what was going on but was for some reason inclined to ignore the misdeeds of Jam Sadiq Ali and his associates. Indeed, he was so closely in touch with the day-to-day affairs of the province that when a charge of rape was levelled against his son-in-law Irfanullah Marwat, he lost no time in swearing by his innocence.

Senator Ishtiaq Azhar of MQM who met the President on June 22 said in his speech in the Senate a day later that the Chief of the Army Staff was acting in a partisan manner. He claimed that the assurances given to the MQM when the decision was taken to launch operation clean-up were not being honoured. What were the assurances given to the MQM? And who gave those assurances? Mr Ishtiaq Azhar also stated that he came away from his meeting with the president with the impression that the President's instructions to the army not to occupy the offices of MQM were not being honoured. Again no explanation or rebuttal was offered by any Senator belonging to the IJI. Nor has any contradiction been issued so far by the President's Secretariat. One must, therefore, assume that some assurances protective

of its interests must have been given to the MQM. The people are entitled to know why any assurance that was likely to go against the declared objective of the government to keep the army operation absolutely neutral and even-handed, was ever given to the MQM. Was it not realised that any MQM-oriented assurances would only jeopardise the operation and undermine the prestige of the Armed Forces?

The President chaired all the important meetings where the objectives of the operation were discussed and decided. He must now take the nation into confidence. The people must know whether the province of Sindh has remained hostage to MQM for so long to suit the political designs of the President or the IJI government or both. The President will be told not to descend to the level of persons who ask such irreverent questions. We would like to assure the President that we have raised these questions because they are on everybody's mind. They are causing great concern and confusion and if they remain unanswered they will undermine the prestige of the government and the effectiveness of the Armed Forces. Public memory may be short but it has a way of recalling every insult, every slight and every gesture of indifferences. Those whom the people put on a pedestal must not forget that they remain accountable to the people and within their reach, and however lofty the pedestals may look, they have a way of sinking into oblivion.

### Solutions Not Easy

92AS1204G Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
26 Jun 92 p 6

[Article by Syed Fahd Husain: "The Sindh Wound Continues To Bleed"; quotation marks as published]

[Text] As events unfold at breakneck speed, Karachi remains embroiled in a turmoil of political activity. The future has never been more uncertain. Power, which was hesitantly flowing from the Chief Minister's office has now been re-routed through the barrel of the gun.

Will Muzaffar Shah survive? What does the future hold for the MQM? These burning questions are dominating the minds of the majority. Whatever the answers, one thing is certain—the army is now in full command and the power-sharing troika of the Chief Minister, IG Sindh and the Corps Commander is, for all practical purposes, defunct.

The options in front of Islamabad are threefold:

- 1) Try to hold together the present coalition in the Sindh government, as powerless as it may be;
- 2) Remove the present Chief Minister and nominate someone more acceptable to the major players, who could play a more effective role;
- 3) Dissolve the assembly and impose Governor's rule.

The first option is becoming increasingly difficult with each passing day. The army feels frustrated as legally it remains answerable to the civilian authorities. Muzaffar Shah is reported to have been not too happy about the assertive role of the army and the major changes that it has demanded in the civil administration. Mr Shah had to scurry away to Islamabad to complain about his grievances. It was only after assurances from the Capital that he apparently came back to Karachi satisfied.

As such, he is playing no useful role in the scheme of things. His coalition government is hanging by a thread. It is believed that if the army is given full powers under Article 245, many sitting MPAs [members of the provincial assembly] of the Sindh Assembly will be nabbed on charges of illegal activities and harbouring and protecting dacoits. They are said to be exerting tremendous pressure on Muzaffar Shah to resist an army takeover. Having inherited a coalition government which was artificially patched together by Jam Sadiq through political bribes and blackmail, Muzaffar Shah has all but realised that he is incapable of governing like his predecessor. Most others have also realised this fact.

If the turncoats withdraw their support, or look for a better deal from the Opposition, the coalition will disintegrate. The support of the MQM, therefore becomes decisive. In the wake of the present crackdown on MQM, their continuing support remains uncertain.

Amidst this prevailing confusion, if the PPP [Pakistan People's Party] decides to call a no-confidence motion against Muzaffar Shah, it will in all likelihood, be passed. This will wrest the initiative from Islamabad and enable the PPP to push their nominee for the post. With a PPP government in Sindh, Operation Cleanup is bound to undergo a radical change. Acute political embarrassment for Islamabad will be an added factor.

Replacing Muzaffar Shah will not produce any significant results. The absence of an effective substitute is a glaring problem. Nomination of an MQM candidate is unlikely, given the operation against the organisation and the arrests of many of its leaders.

Moreover, the post of Chief Minister has become an unenviable one given the lack of manoeuvrability of its occupant under the present circumstances. There is not much a Chief Minister can do, with the army increasing its assertiveness each day and the PPP looming large on the horizon. The Prime Minister should be well aware that this option leads to a dead end.

Most political observers are predicting Governor's rule for the province. This seems to be the only way out of the present quagmire. It will free the Federal government of all political constraints and give the army all the authority it needs to carry out the operation. The army has repeatedly been heard saying that it wants to net some big fish but is being held back by political shackles. Governor's rule will give it an opportunity to go after the influentials who have always been out of the reach of law enforcing agencies.

What makes this option unattractive to the present government in Islamabad is the fact that fresh elections have to be held after three months. If held fairly, there is little doubt that PPP will emerge the winner. It is widely believed here that a truly representative government in Sindh will improve the political situation. With an MQM [Mujahir Qaum Movement] sweep in Karachi and Hyderabad and a clear PPP majority returned from the rural areas, a PPP-MQM coalition would be the most natural consequence.

Such a scenario is, however totally unacceptable to the Centre. It will lead to a Centre-Sindh political tussle, reminiscent of the Punjab-Centre deadlock during the PPP government. As the titans battle it out, the losers will once again be the people of Sindh.

However, events may just push the Federal government to exercise this option. Amongst other things, it will elevate the army directly on to centre stage, free of all checks and balances. And this is something which the people are dreading.

The army has not even begun to realise the damage the Jamshoro killings have done to its credibility in the eyes of the people. Sindhis saw the army as a persecuting force and this image was reinforced after the Shah Bandar and Tando Bahawal incidents. Now after the crack-down on MQM, many Mohajirs are doubting the army's impartiality. Said one Mohajir, "The army planted weapons to prove that Tando Bahawal victims were terrorists. How do I know that they (the army) are not doing the same in case of MQM?"

There is no easy solution to the dilemma facing the authorities in Islamabad. It is quite probable that while they deliberate on this Sindh "ulcer," events may well outpace them. And that may exacerbate the already bleeding wound.

#### **Representative Government Needed**

92AS1204H Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
25 Jun 92 p 4

[Article by Musarrat Babar: "Aftermath of the MQM Split"; first paragraph is THE MUSLIM comment]

[Text] The discovery of a state within a state in Karachi indictors everyone from the President down to the Provincial Chief Minister and calls for a drastic change in the old order and resetting of the political agenda.

The violent split in the MQM [Mujahir Qaum Movement] which left at least 10 activists killed, scores injured, and Karachi metropolis under curfew and military control was as mysterious and sudden as the rise of MQM [Mujahir Qaum Movement] itself. As if from nowhere the MQM dissidents who have so far been living in hiding appeared on the scene, ransacked and captured the offices of the mainstream organization whose leaders and office-bearers went into hiding, in a strange replay of the birth and rise of MQM under the

tutelage of General Zia and his ISI, the violent appearance of dissidents last Friday also seemed possible under the shadow of bayonets of the Army and Rangers.

What followed was even more bizarre. The Army and Rangers discovered torture cells and private jails allegedly established by the mainstream MQM to punish Pir Bhais' dissidents and harrowing tales of torture were splashed in the media. Uncharacteristically the Army Chief General Asif Nawaz went public in denouncing the MQM saying that people had enough of extortion and torture and the state of siege imposed by it. MQM chief Altaf Hussain was quick to deny allegations of torture cells and private jails from his safe sanctuary in London where he is living in self-imposed exile ever since General Asif Nawaz took command of the Army in August last. Both General Nawaz and Altaf Hussain reportedly know each other rather too well since the days the General was Corps Commander Karachi during the Benazir government.

The bizarre touch in the MQM split was dramatised by at least two things. First, while the MQM is still part of the Federal Government and rules the roost in the province of Sindh, the official electronic media prominently displayed the discovery of torture cells in the Lines Area and the terrorist activities of the MQM. Not only that but top leadership of the Movement including some VIPs particularly those against whom cases were registered in the past were reportedly put on the Exit Control List. A case was registered against MQM Vice Chairman Salim Shahzad, an MNA [member of national assembly], for kidnapping and robbery which allegedly took place a year back. It was given out that agencies have found documents which link MQM to terrorist activities. It has also been said that the area around the torture cells would be dug to probe whether there were mass graves or not. All this tended to show that MQM was no longer a part of the Federal Government or was on its way out.

Second, the lightning operation by dissidents itself raised some questions. How was it possible for the dissidents to take over the offices of mainstream organization in a swoop at a time when the Army and Rangers were already patrolling the city to prevent any outbreak of violence? How come the intelligence agencies failed to take notice of the organisation and planning which must have gone into the operation 'takeover' by dissidents?

The simultaneous attacks on several MQM offices and houses in different parts of the city, the rather well arranged press conference soon after the capture of Liaqatabad office of MQM and the extraordinary courage shown by the dissidents who were till recently in hiding only proves the forethought and planning that must have preceded the violence. Now wonder the MQM chief Altaf Hussain has alleged that Friday's violence was part of a conspiracy to eliminate the MQM. [sentence as published]

The question which must be addressed now is: what next, and can the civilian government of Mr Nawaz Sharif handle the mammoth fall-out of the operation?

Soon after his return from abroad the Prime Minister on Monday met the President to discuss the Sindh situation. The two top men reportedly expressed complete satisfaction with the strategy adopted to execute the military operation in Sindh. Echoing the words from Islamabad the Sindh Chief Minister Syed Muzaffar Hussain Shah also said that Operation clean-up was proceeding in the right direction and dispelled the impression that Governor Rule was about to be imposed in the province.

But mere expressions of satisfaction and claiming that the operation was going in the right direction would not solve the problem. More questions will now be raised from the very answers given so far. For instance, if the operation is proceeding in the right direction as claimed by the Sindh Chief Minister it certainly implies an endorsement of the discovery of torture cells, private jails and terrorist links of the MQM. But the MQM is still in the government and it is pertinent to ask whether the Sindh Chief Minister and the Prime Minister knew about the terrorist links of their partners in government

If Syed Muzaffar Shah already knew about these links he will have to do a lot of explaining as to what did he do about it or why did he condone it. If he was unaware he will still have to explain whether such an ill-informed person was qualified to become the province chief executive. The Prime Minister and the President also have to do a great deal of explaining. While both have been issuing a clean chit to Jam-Marwat-MQM combine and its successor, i.e., the Shah government, an important ally and component of that combine has turned out to be a terrorist organization.

The government will be trapped in a dead end if it does not strive to make the whole operation being perceived as even-handed which is possible only if it corrects its own political agenda. Just a day after the crackdown on MQM the former Chief of Army Staff General Aslam Beg said in Peshawar that MQM was no exception and there were other individuals and groups involved in terrorist activities. He particularly mentioned the name of Irfanullah Marwat, the President's son-in-law and a provincial minister as one such person involved in terrorist activities. But while the MQM leaders have reportedly been placed on the Exit Control List, Mr Marwat and his family are on their way to London today (Thursday). Will it strengthen or weaken the credibility of "Operation Clean-up" as even handed?

The military action must be backed by political action. In order to prevent the Sindh situation from degenerating into an East Pakistan-like situation, the people of the province must be allowed a free hand to form their own representative government without remote control manipulation from Islamabad. If the political priority of Islamabad is still to hound the opposition and keep it out

of power in the province by hook or crook, the opportunity created by the split in MQM will be lost with dangerous consequences.

The discovery of a state within a state in Karachi indict everyone from the President down to the Provincial Chief Minister and calls for a drastic change in the old order and resetting of the political agenda. If Islamabad insists on the old order, acts in a manner to prolong the Jam-Marwat phase and continues to suffer from the Zia syndrome vis-a-vis the PPP, it will be only courting disaster. If however, it recasts its agenda to set up a consensus representative government in Sindh irrespective of who forms it, then the MQM split may prove to be a blessing in disguise.

### MQM Mafia Exposed

92AS1204I Islamabad *THE MUSLIM* in English  
23 Jun 92 p 6

[Editorial: "Why Was This State Within a State Ignored?"]

[Text] It came as no surprise, at least to those of us who wield a pen for a living, that torture cells established by the MQM [Muhajir Qaum Movement] existed in Karachi in the areas dominated by this fascist organisation. What did come as news was that the MQM people had arrogated to themselves the authority to hang people who proved more stubborn in their dissidence. The only reason why the press was not so open in bringing the state of terror perpetrated by the MQM was that all sources of information were mortally afraid of sudden and horrendous retribution that they just would not talk. That these torture cells operated with the approval of the Pir of Azizabad, Altaf Hussain, is indisputable. It is also indisputable that the Sindh administration was in full knowledge of the goings on. It is no secret that the MQM is an organisation created under the orders of the dictator Zia and there is no reason to believe that he was unaware of all that was being done under the patronage of his protege Altaf Hussain. It boggles the mind that these torture cells were allowed to operate by the government.

The tales being told by the people of the Lines Area and other districts of Karachi under the influence of the MQM mafia about the way people were tortured, are nauseating. Dissidents were hung upside down, beaten with rods and had their bodies subjected to the horrors that drilling machines can inflict. And they or their heirs could not object for fear that they would have to face more of the same. It is only now that the 'law enforcing agencies' have clamped down on the affected areas and 'uncovered' the torture cells that erstwhile victims or the heirs of those who were sadistically tortured to death or hanged, have come out with the gruesome details of their ordeals. The only irony in the whole story is that the very agency which was entrusted by dictator Zia with the task

of creating and then funding the MQM throughout the course of its nefarious activities, was involved in its denunciation!

Whatever has come to light must have horrified the man in the street, at least downcountry, but this is not where the buck should stop. It is now obligatory for these same law enforcing agencies to unearth and unveil the bestial elements who operated these cells as well as those who ordered their setting up in the first place. And this means also that those in power who knew what was going on should also be held to full accountability. Those held in the torture cells were most certainly illegally detained, as unlawfully tortured and the hangings carried out constitute murder most foul. Even the most kind hearted among us would recommend that these people be given exemplary punishment. Without fear or favour. This does not preclude the Pir of Azizabad. He should be made to return to the country and answer for the multitude of sins against his fellow countrymen which can be proved. Finally, what sort of a government do we have that can allow such atrocities to be perpetrated on its citizens? Unless, of course, the intelligence agencies have not been doing their jobs, which is understandably par for the course.

### Beg Praises Military Role

92AS1204J Islamabad *THE MUSLIM* in English  
23 Jun 92 p 5

[Quotation marks as published]

[Text] Peshawar, June 22—Army should not be taken for granted, it cannot exceed a limit, and we should search for political solution of Sindh problem.

This was proposed by former COAS [Chief of the Army Staff], Mirza Aslam Beg, while concluding a seminar on "Law and order situation in Pakistan" organised by Peshawar chapter of Friends at a five-star hotel on Monday evening. The seminar was addressed by former Chairman, Economics Department, Peshawar University, Dr Mian Mohammad Nazir, Qazi Shamsuddin and Sikander Khan, Advocates, while it was participated by a large number of intellectuals, doctors, retired civil and military officers.

He said the situation in Sindh was similar to that of East Pakistan from the point of view that there also the largest political party was ignored and in Sindh too. But he hoped that the situation in Sindh would not go to that extent. He claimed that the credit goes to the Army for unearthing the secret torture cells of an ethnic group. He stressed that Sindhis should be let alone and allowed to solve their problem.

Mirza Aslam Beg regretted that in Pakistan the people could not develop culture of politics and dialogue because of their feudal background. In Pakistan affirming the views of a participant, Prof Karamullah he said that the situation had reached a point where crime and politics had mixed due to which the problem

had become one hand, while on the other he pointed out, that after the death of Jam Sadiq talks and understanding-like situation was created but immediately sabotaged by self-interested elements, and the result was before the people.

### Sindh Military Operations Analyzed

#### Expanded Operation Needed

92AS1171A Lahore NAWA-I-WAQT in Urdu 17 Jun 92 p 4

[Editorial: "Sindh: Expanded Operation Needed"]

[Text] The military leadership held a press briefing in Karachi to shed additional light on the Sindh operation. The salient points of this meeting were:

- There are administrative weaknesses in the operation. Recommendations for transferring administrative personnel and Sindh police personnel are being prepared;
- The government has definite proof that a foreign hand is behind the incidents in Sindh and that many educated young men are receiving training across the border;
- The documents confiscated from the persons arrested at Shah Bander clearly indicate that al-Zulfiqar is involved; however, it could not be decided whether a political party is supporting it or not;
- The military does not have a magic wand that it can use to correct everything in Sindh overnight. For it, the economic, social, and political situation in Sindh must be corrected, and this is the job of the government.

After reviewing these points, we can understand how complicated and serious a situation has emerged from the Sindh operation. As punishment for the mistakes that the military has committed in this operation, the transfer of the whole military command of Hyderabad has been affected. In addition, if administrative negligence and weakness are present, a foreign hand is behind it, and agents of al-Zulfiqar are also active, then it is certain that the military has no magic way to quickly correct the situation. It is the government's responsibility to remove the shortcomings, weaknesses, negligence, and problems by introducing a reliable package. We said in the beginning of this operation that the military alone could not take responsibility for everything. It is important that all political and religious parties in Sindh be taken into confidence and that their full cooperation be requested. It was encouraging that not only Sindh, but also political and religious groups nationwide, approved of the military action in Sindh to end the lawlessness there. However, this reaction was their own. The government did not try to do anything to get their support. All it did was discuss the issue in the National Assembly for a few days. This discussion did not prove to be beneficial or conclusive, because it was carried out without any preparation or formal notice. It

was important that the government arranged a briefing for all political parties, detailed discussions were carried out about the lawlessness in Sindh, the points of view of every party were listened to, and a joint promise was made in front of the whole nation that no political party would support terrorism, violence, murder, destruction, looting, abduction, theft, or robbery in Sindh, and that they would not protect any criminals or apply any political pressure to save criminals. The problem now is that the government did not try to have this agreement, nor did any political party promise the nation that it would not interfere with the operation's activities. The people are not even aware of the opinions of Sindh's three major political parties—the MQM [Muhajir Qaumi Movement], the IJI [Islami Jamhoor Ittehad], and the PDA [People's Democratic Alliance]. These parties have not declared that they are not associated with the lawlessness in Sindh, or that they would stay away from supporting the criminals. Meanwhile, the ambitions of the criminal groups in Sindh are not hidden from anyone. The Indian intelligence agency, RA, and its agents are definitely working to spread unrest. This way, the military operation has become very puzzling and complex. In addition, political, social, and economic problems in this state have made the situation even more serious.

If we review our country's past military actions, it would scare even a common man. Many fears and suspicions come into his mind. Benazir Bhutto, the opposition leader, has also said that the war in Sindh is a war to keep Pakistan alive. There is no doubt that the situation in Sindh is closely related to the future of our country. It has evolved into a volcano. If it erupts, everything will be burned to ashes. It is the duty of Benazir Bhutto to help make Pakistan's war successful in Sindh and to close ranks with those who support Pakistan. She should play an important role in making the military operation successful in order to provide peaceful lives for the present and future generations. She should remove the impression that she does not even support the good actions of this government because of her political opposition. The government should also do its duty and come out of its shell. It should try to unite the patriotic Pakistani parties and finish its job with their support. The military leadership is also pressuring for social, economic, and political action in Sindh. It is important that the military does its work at its level and creates a peaceful atmosphere. The elected government should get the support and advice of other political leaders in Sindh and eradicate all the causes that are responsible for this situation. A lack of widespread action and just starting a military operation will not solve Sindh's problems.

#### Impacting National Politics

92AS1171B Lahore NAWA-I-WAQT in Urdu 15 Jun 92 p 10

[Article by Itaul Rehman: "Military Operation in Sindh and Pakistani National Politics"]

[Text] It seems that political activities in Pakistan have come to a standstill while awaiting the results of the military operation in Sindh. Following poet Nawabzada Nasrullah Khan "The nightingale is still busy singing its song," some parties are still thinking about public meetings and rallies even in this situation. All other political parties and our country's leadership are waiting patiently for the results of this historical step taken in modern Pakistan. If this operation is successful, then it will have important effects on our national security. It will also cause changes in Sindh's political map. The national politics of Pakistan will also be influenced by this operation. God forbid, if this operation is unsuccessful, then the problems that Sindh is now facing will be spread throughout our whole country and will affect our internal and external security. Therefore, we should know that as a nation, we have brought ourselves to a very dangerous point by starting this operation. A very minor mistake in decisionmaking and even the slightest shaking of one's foot could prove to be extremely dangerous to our nation.

The Muslim League, our ruling party, is directly involved in this decision, and it is expected that it will take the lion's share of credit if Sindh's operation is successful. The result of its failure will also fall on it. The Muslim League is the founding party of Pakistan. Because of this great deed it is fueling our country despite its various flaws. The fact is that the historic accomplishment of establishing Pakistan was not the work of the present Muslim League. It was achieved by the All India Muslim League. The Pakistan Muslim League may be the descendant of this great political party; however, it is not possible that it has the kind of leadership that the All India Muslim League was fortunate enough to have. Its workers and members do not have the strong feeling and desire for the progress, development, and security of the Islamic Democracy of Pakistan as did the leadership and followers of the All India Muslim League. The Muslim League Party that is in power now is not here because of its own qualities that have impressed the nation, or because it won this place by hard work. The real reason is that our country was tired of the military dictatorship and the mental and practical anarchy practiced by the PPP [Pakistan People's Party]. The nation and its groups decided to put new life into the structure of the Muslim League Party to get rid of the earlier rulers and to put the Muslim League back into government. Now, merely 19 months after taking power, it has to face the challenge of launching a military operation in a sensitive state like Sindh. The problem our government is now facing is that Sindh, which is suffering from racial, ethnic, and urban-rural divisions, has no strong political foundation or support. The state government established there is controlled by the MQM [Munajir Qaumi Movement] in urban areas, and the ruling Muslim party, which is actually a factional Muslim League, has the support of Pir Pagara. He claims to represent the rural areas and wants to keep the PPP out of the government. In this situation, the history of Pakistan tells us that the central government becomes

too dependent on the advice of the bureaucracy. The problem with our bureaucracy is that it was neither started during Pakistan's earlier period nor does it agree with Pakistan's Islamic and democratic demands. The whole structure, education, and training of our bureaucracy is from the colonial period. Therefore, it is used to viewing any important or not-so-important issue outside of the framework of law and order. That is where the misfortune of every ruler and party started during the 45-year history of our nation. Therefore, the Pakistan Muslim League, as a political party, must do one thing first. It should make a political place for itself in both major regions and ethnic populations in Sindh. It must encourage the development of feeling for Pakistan among them. If the Pakistan Muslim League does this work, then it will not only benefit politically, but will also emerge as the successor of the All India Muslim League. It lost its prestige because it did not do its duties during the 1950's, and it lost power. In this process, it also hurt Pakistan. To this end, Muslim League leaders must make major changes in their lifestyles and political approaches. Since the establishment of Pakistan, their lifestyles have been ones of trying to take all kinds of advantages when in the seat of power, and they never made any sacrifices as political activists. Their political approach has been to find a path that is easy way to get power. That is why, since 1953, they had been returning to power with the help of the military and the bureaucracy. It was the military and the bureaucracy that removed the party when they wanted to. The Pakistan Muslim League, at this very critical point in Pakistan's history, must make some important changes for its own existence. Otherwise, even if Operation Flamingo in Sindh is successful, the ruling party will not benefit. If the Muslim League used the MQM and another Jamai-Sadiq as a crutch and did not strengthen its political foundation in the state, then it would have to write the chapter of its own political failure.

The second-largest national political party, according to its strength in Parliament, is the Pakistan Peoples Party. It has staked a lot on the present military operation in Sindh. This party presents itself as the most effective symbol of Pakistan in Sindh's rural areas. This claim is based on some truth; at the same time, it is also playing its famous "Sindh card" close to its chest. Mrs. Benazir Bhutto's 1986 statement is on record in it; she said that even Sindh's robbers were very patriotic. This statement was used to strengthen this card. The PPP leadership is so sensitive about its Sindh card that it sacrificed the prime ministership in 1991 but did not let this card be hurt. The present PPP has a political identity because it is a symbol of Pakistan's unity and, at the same time, holds the Sindh card. These two are also causing many problems for it. If the Sindh Operation is successful, then the PPP's Sindh card will surely be weakened. However, if its leadership tries to strengthen this role by winning the hearts of the Urdu-speaking citizens of Sindh, then, as a symbol of the federal government, its position will be strengthened and upgraded.

If the Sindh operation fails for some reason, then the PPP will obviously use this for its own benefit, in order to make the Sindh card even sharper. It will also strengthen its position as a symbol of the federal government. The situation will perhaps be more harmful if there was only one ethnic group living in Sindh or if the major population there was united. However, at the present time, when the PPP is just another party to fight the MQM in the political map of Sindh, then the failure of Sindh's military operation will not benefit the PPP. The situation will definitely ruin Wadi Mehran. Such a development will be very bad for the PPP, along with Sindh and Pakistan, because such developments always give rise to extremist leaders in their wake. Such a leader will make the PPP ineffective. Therefore, the political forces have brought the military operation to Sindh as a last resort. In other words, the ruling Muslim League Party and the military of Pakistan should make sure that this operation is successful within a specific period. It is important for the PPP as a national political party that it increase its influence among the Urdu-speaking people of Sindh. This will help them both.

Pakistan's third national political party is the Jamaat-i-Islami. On the outside, it seems that this party is not involved in Sindh's operations. If the two major populations in Sindh, it has not helped the Sindhi-speaking people. Therefore, it cannot become a major force there. It was once popular among the Urdu-speaking people; however, when the extremists took power there, they pushed the Jamaat-i-Islami into the background. The military operation in Sindh will affect the extremist groups from both populations. Therefore, the success of this operation can be very satisfactory for the Jamaat-i-Islami. However, if this operation is unsuccessful, then the Jamaat-i-Islami will be affected negatively. It should know that being an ideological force in Pakistan, it cannot escape the results. Therefore, it is the duty of the Jamaat-i-Islami to spread the message of Islam, which is love and brotherhood among both populations in Sindh. In such a way that they do not even suspect that their cultural identity is being infiltrated. Sindh's culture, language, and literature is the proud inheritance of the Muslims. It should merge with Islam's ideological appeal and the demands of Pakistan's nationality in such a way that ideological differences between the proponents of an Islamic nation and the protectors of Sindhi language and culture are eliminated. The Islamic Shariat has recognized it as a source on laws, and they should be knowledgeable about the traditions and life of a specific group that clash with the basic principles of Islam. The question arises: Which side of Sindhi culture clashes with Islamic rules? If this is not true, then the Jamaat-i-Islami should think about the basic weakness in its approach. It cannot become an ideological force in Sindh without it. As a representative of Islam and as an ideological movement, which the Jamaat-i-Islami claims to be, it has to play a role between the two Muslim populations in Wadi Mehran. If the Jamaat-i-Islami cannot play this role, then its leaders should go back and study the Koran more and learn more about Sindh and its present situation.

The success or failure of Sindh's military operation will fall mostly on the leadership. The plans of this operation are being made by military officials. They will be implemented by officers and soldiers. The constitutional article under which these rights are given to the military have been accepted by the military leadership. According to some constitutional experts, this article is not appropriate. The government has clarified that it will not hesitate in implementing Article 245 in the absence of better and more effective results. In this situation, there seems to be no obstacle in the military's path to achieve its goal. No one in Pakistan has any doubt about the patriotism and capability of their armed forces. However, because of some bitter experiences in the past, some people are skeptical. In order to remove these doubts, it is important that the negligence practised in the past, especially in 1983, not be repeated. There are no two opinions about it, and the military leadership knows well that if a military operation is not impartial, then it is nothing. The job was given to the military for this reason, because a political government is always weak due to its nature and approach. It develops friendship and sympathy for some elements and groups in the society, and opposition to others. In Third World countries, such friendships and opposition especially affect the government. Therefore, the military is asked to help when the situation gets out of control. However, if the military is also suspected to be partial to one group, then such an operation will only have negative results. If our armed forces have taken the responsibility of establishing peace in Sindh, then its dignity and national security demand that it meet the expectations of this challenge by remaining within the constitutional framework. It should not leave any stone unturned to achieve this goal. The opinion that is being expressed is that the military and law enforcement agencies will have a very difficult time discriminating between a political worker, a terrorist, and a robber in Sindh's urban and rural areas. A terrorist is a terrorist, regardless of which political party he is affiliated with. The image of the law is that anybody who violates it will be arrested, even if he is the elected president or prime minister of the country. There can be no leniency in this regard. The present situation in Sindh is such that every robber and terrorist is a member of an ethnic or political group and can call himself a political activist. In this situation, the real job for the army is to find all those robbers and terrorists who are being protected by small or large political parties, influential landlords, and important government officials. The political activist is definitely a respectable member of any society; however, if robbery and terrorism use this disguise to achieve their wicked goals, then it is the job of law enforcement agencies to act and to arrest those who encourage terrorism in the name of politics. If the Pakistani army completes the Sindh operation with professional competency and full impartiality, then in addition to serving the nation appropriately, it will also regain its prestige, which was affected badly as a result of the 1971 war.

### Commentary Views Senate Happenings, Sindh Situation

*AKASHI MUSLIM had THE MUSLIM in English (21 Jun 92 p 12)*

[Article by Muhammad Yasin, "Humble Slip of Tongue: What a Loss of Time and Money"]

[Text] How nonchalant and casual are our honourable legislators about the burning national issues, like determining law and order situation in Sindh as also towards abuse of human rights and deployment of the army under Article 143 could well be gauged by the fact that there were only one-fourth of Senators present in the House on the first day of the new parliamentary year of the Senate.

And more regrettable is the fact that the sitting lasted only about 20 minutes—consumed in condoling the passing away of three Senators. No harm in remembering the dear departed ones and paying tributes to their qualities of the head and heart. But, should the business of the other House be adjourned for the rest of the day to mourn the death of the former or sitting members?

The country is going through extra-ordinary times. Law and order situation in Sindh is definitely out of control, while in the province of Balochistan, it is deteriorating day by day. In NWFP [North-West Frontier Province], there is a meaningful silence. With Afghan warlords making the things hot in Afghanistan, and lakhs of Afghan refugees still based in NWFP, the things could take a turn for the worse any time.

This is the time that the legislators should deliberate over the national issues and try to pull over chestnuts out of the fire. But, you find in the House only seven Ministers and Ministers of State occupying the ministerial benches. Even the Leader of the Opposition as also majority of Senators were missing. Seven ministers and their spouses are accompanying the Prime Minister on his visit to London. First, they had gone to Rio de Janeiro, and then in the swinging Spain. Where have the rest of the ministers gone? Why did they make themselves scarce from the House? It passes understanding. Even the PM's [Prime Minister] whiz-kid—Ch Nisar Ali did not bother to attend the Senate.

How much does a sitting of the Senate cost to the public exchequer? The budgetary allocation for the Senate for the year 1991/92 is Rupees 70,594.00. A single day's sitting costs the public exchequer exactly a sum of Rupees 1,816.25 and paisa 19. The employees of the Senate start getting special allowance for the session seven days in advance of the beginning of the session and seven days at the end of it. The rate of the allowance is 35 percent of the basic pay. A Senator gets DATA [Daily Allowance Travelling Allowance] at the rate of Rupees 50/- a day and it is admissible two days before the session

starts. Thus a lot of money is spent on the honourable legislators from the public exchequer. It is a poor nation that pays for it.

The overall deficit suffered by the nation last year going by official admission amounted to Rupees 72 billion. But independent economists put the figure of deficit at Rupees 100 billion. In the new fiscal year, the economic situation is going to be much worse than the last year. That means the government and the legislators must keep tight control on the丽.

In the cafeteria of the Parliament House, the cost of the welcoming crowd for the Prime Minister's reception in London was the subject of interesting discussion. During a vernacular paper, a few legislators discussed with newsmen the money spent by the High Commission on arranging the Pakistan crowd. The report had mentioned that a sum of 4,000 pounds sterling was spent in transporting the Pakistanis but only 300 would be needed. In terms of Pakistani currency, every Pakistani who came to welcome the Pakistani delegation, cost Rupees 100.

The Law Minister Khawaja Abdul Saboor made a humble slip of tongue while reading the memorial obituary of Senator Ghulam Farooq. Instead of reading it correctly, he made a faux pas and read the name as "Ghulam Ishaq." But immediately he realised the slip he had made, corrected it and read the correct name as Ghulam Farooq.

At the initiative of PDA's [People's Democratic Alliance] Senator Abdul Shah, the House gave a offer Fataha for the nine innocent villagers massacred in village Tando Banuwal Jamshoro by the Major now in the arms custody in Karachi. The House also offered Fataha for Bhakarani and other people who died in the custody of an agency in the interior of Sindh. Earlier separate Fataha was offered for the souls of three Senators.

Why did Ch Nisar Ali cancel his press conference at the PM's Secretariat? His press conference had suddenly acquired meaningful dimensions since he was regarded as the PM's eyes and ears and a "PM in the making."

MJM's [Muslim Jamaat Movement] Senator Ishrat Azhar did not look happy about the things happening in Karachi. "They have designs against us," he said while talking to THE MUSLIM. Though he did not qualify what he meant by "they," it was obvious what he meant. "None of us will leave Karachi," when he was asked if the legislators put on exit control list were from MQM. "All of us would stay wherever they are," he said adding that "we have created peaceful conditions in Karachi."

**Sindh: PPP Reiterates Illegitimacy of Rulers**  
*Al-Ummah Muhammed Ith Muslim* in English  
 Vol 42 p 1

[Text] Karachi, June 30.—Pakistan People's Party (PPP) has decided to requisition the Sindh Assembly to know whether it is a headless body without any Speaker.

The decision has been taken by the party's Sindh committee, said Sheikh Rafig, the PPP Secretary-General who along with the Sindh party president Saeed Qaim Ali Shah addressed a joint Press conference here at Bhawal House on Tuesday.

They said the PPP could not support dissolution of the Assembly notwithstanding that there was a crisis in the province.

They however reiterated their demand for immediate dissolution of the National Assembly as well as all the Provincial Assemblies and setting up of an interim government of "national consensus" to hold independent and free elections.

In response to a question, the PPP leaders also denied having any contact with the MUM (Muhammed Qaum Movement) dissidents. They also expressed their ignorance about the number of resignations submitted by MUM MPs (Member of Provincial Assembly), saying "we don't know that as much has appeared in the Press. We do not know where the Speaker of Sindh Assembly is."

Asked what was their party's view of the Sindh crisis, they said they were still discussing various options and added that they would inform the Press within the next few days.

As for the requisition of Sindh Assembly they said "it depends on conditions and attitude of the Provincial Government which according to them lacked political initiative."

The PPP leaders said law and order problem should be solved through political means and claimed that PPP had the capacity to protect the life and honour of the people.

On army's clean-up operation in Sindh they said that so far Army operation had been impartial but hastened to add "the PPP has no understanding with the army." They hoped that the army would continue its operation to dacoits, terrorists and criminals.

Meanwhile—the two-day Central Executive Committee (CEC) meeting of the PPP ended with a call to all the democratic and nationalist forces to prepare for a struggle to overthrow the Ishaq—Nawaz Muiaffar Shah rule saying the country was confronted with a crisis of conscience.

A policy statement issued on Tuesday said the root cause of the present crisis was nothing but the illegitimacy of the rulers.

The CEC meeting was chaired by Mr Benazir Bhutto.

The statement read out by the PPP's Secretary-General Sheikh Rafigh Ahmed at a press briefing on Tuesday called for immediate resignation of the President, Prime Minister and Chief Minister. It also demanded free and fair elections under an interim government of national consensus. "In case this demand is not accepted, the party reserves the right to resign from the sham assemblies and launch a mass movement against the government," the statement warned.

It also called for dissolution of local bodies throughout the country and demanded fresh elections. The party also demanded replacement of Chief Election Commissioner by a person nominated by consensus of major parties.

The PPP reiterated that operation clean-up did not present a lasting solution of the problems of Sindh. Only a genuinely popular democratic government can put an end to the vicious cycle of lawlessness, popular anger, expansion of dacoity and crime, lack of investment, fiscal policies, lack of organization, misgovernance and law and order crisis.

Criticizing the government, the party said that before the operation clean-up started from Pothohar, Prime Minister Chaudhary Sharif and Interior Minister were trying to prove that Sindh is alright, on the other side has diminished and that the people are absolutely content with the situation. "The word power to the operation, it said the government was trying to claim that the people are safe in Sindh and that there was no need in panic.

**Law and Order in Balochistan Said Deteriorating**  
*Al-Ummah Muhammed Ith Muslim* in English Vol 42 p 8

[Article by Nasir Fazlani: "Aggravating Law and Order in Balochistan"]

[Text] Lahore, June 4.—The assassination of Naval Bugti son of Nawab Akbar Bugti has added a serious dimension to the law and order situation in the province.

The fact that the murder took place at and sunset and that too in one of the most crowded areas of the provincial capital speaks for itself. It was not the anti-clerical of any kind that has posed a challenge to the law enforcement agencies.

Not long ago three other influential leaders Sardar Taj Muhammad Baloch, chief of the Baloch tribe and Hameed Bugti, a leader of the tribe have been killed and even if these tribal were not politically motivated—although the majority of both tribes charged the Akbar Bugti family with involvement in the murder—the fact that Sardar Taj is a very carry political influence and in cases from party affiliation cannot be ignored altogether.

## POLITICAL

JPRS-NEA-92-092

21 July 1992

The situation in Balochistan has been of concern for quite some time. The cabinet has been a queer admixture of heterogeneous elements and the coexisting partners have hardly anything in common, except the temporary expediences and personal equation among themselves. The ethnic divide between the Pathans and the Baluchs has subsided for the time being, the eight-long curfew in Quetta has only recently been lifted. During the debate on the provincial budget, Dr. Kalimullah of the Pathan-oriented Milli Awami Party had demanded that the two Baluchs formed 22 percent of the population of the province and should be represented with the Baluchs on party basis.

The problem arising from Pathan-Baluch differences in representation in Quetta Municipal Corporation, remains unresolved and has been referred to a judicial committee. Things continue to be serious in the local bodies system and election to the chairman of town and municipal committees, district council, even union councils are yet to be held.

Coming on such a background, these fatal attempts have created a sense of insecurity and people have been talking about "hidden hands" behind these unfortunate incidents so that Balochistan would be dragged into turmoil and turbulence as the pattern of Sindh.

Despite its backwardness, particularly in the mountainous ranges, Balochistan has witnessed a lot of development activity since its emergence as a province proper. Jerry-built schools and colleges, rural health centers and hospitals have brought the necessary facilities to the common man. Various air flying towns have been linked with Quetta and Karachi through air service while tele-communication facilities have been made available. So will be the case with the natural gas produced in Sui. Thus the province, barring the capital, which had been cut off from the rest of the country, is now pulsating with activity. Quetta, once a sleeping community, is now a sprawling city with a university, has a lot to offer to a visitor, who has not been there for some time. Its

markets stuffed with goods smuggled from Iran—and Afghanistan are an added attraction for those interested in making purchases.

But despite all these developments, the province remains a tribal society. Large parts of the tribal belts are still unapproachable. The tribal customs still have supremacy over normal laws. Women are yet to be brought to the mainstream of the society. The chiefs of the tribes continue to run their own tribal courts and remain the lords of their territories—any dispute involving tribal feud can create a situation fraught with dangerous consequences.

The law and order problem triggered off by the murder of a tribal chief of notable clan flared up and assume an alarming dimension. The problems caused by the presence of a large number of Afghan refugees is likely to persist and the refugees are unlikely to return to their home country where the situation is still unstable and unpredictable.

Balochistan and its tributaries in the tribal belts, are different from other provinces. It is the largest province, over 45 percent of national territory and much larger than even most of the countries, and has a geo-political importance of its own, sharing borders with Iran and Afghanistan. In addition it has ethnic minorities. Its large reservoirs of mineral wealth will remain unexploited.

The province is rather new in the democratic process which began only after it emerged on the national map as a regular and settled province in the wake of dismemberment of the East. When the provincial assembly started functioning following general election in 1970, the literacy rate being low and the population being very sparse, the problems are both difficult and different.

What is, however, needed is well planned strategy to tackle the most fundamental problem—the tribal divide, the Zabul problem which could be the gravest dangerous component of the internal problems at various tiers of local bodies and, of course, the law and order situation. Once allowed to get out of control, the situation could be as grave as in Sindh, particularly because of the largely unpopulated areas and the mountainous terrain.

### Increase in Islamic Sectarian Conflicts Examined

92AS1172 Lahore NIDA-I-KHILAFAT in Urdu  
9 Jun 92 pp 5-6

[Analysis by Abdul Karim Abid: "Sectarianism, Islam, Pakistan; This Is Not an Unforeseen Disaster But the Consequence of Our Own Deeds; Who Will Confront This Destructive Hurricane? Two Large Holes Are Evident in Pakistan's Ship of State; One, the Sindh Split To Remedy for Which the Army Has Been Summoned and Second, the Split in National Unity Created by Sectarianism and No One Knows Who Will Undertake To Heal It and By What Means. The Clashes in Afghanistan Between the Shia Organization Wahdat-i Islami and Its Opponents Will Encourage Sectarian Elements in Our Own Country. Sectarian Disturbances Were Not Uncommon Among Us in the Past; Now More Are Coming by Way of Afghanistan and Their Danger Should be Realized Beforehand"]

[Text] The Pakistan movement was the outcome of Muslim nationalism, which gathered all Muslims on a single platform. But this spirit of nationalism did not provide a strong foundation for unity and soon we were beset by linguistic and sectarian prejudices. The only salvation from such prejudices was to understand in mind and heart the true meaning of Islam; but we understood Islam to be useful only for fighting against the Hindus. To us, the Islamic spirit was to be used only as the basis of fighting at first against the Hindus and later, against India. During these struggles, the need for the true Islam was never felt and the ceremonial, traditional, and emotional Islam was always considered adequate for our needs. But such a ceremonial, traditional, and emotional Islam could not prevent the outbreak of linguistic and sectarian prejudices.

Even after the tragedy of East Pakistan we did not learn our lesson; on the contrary, during this period even those parties and movements, which were formed with the objective of ensuring the victory of the true Islam, were diverted from their course, thus strengthening the hand of the promoters of linguistic and sectarian prejudices. These promoters were of two kinds: those who were part of the Establishment and had learned from the British that the only way to rule was to divide and rule and this was the course that they followed. This policy reached its zenith during Zia's rule when the Establishment encouraged linguistic and sectarian prejudices and provided a wide field of action for both. The other kind of promoters were those individuals who used prejudice as a means of furthering their own leadership aims. Those who supported the Pakistan ideology, Islamic brotherhood and unity continued to lose strength because they thought that mere talk and sloganizing would be sufficient; no full-fledged effort based on sincerity and resolve was made to reform the heart and mind of society. Sectarianism has deep roots in our society and thus the possibilities of the evil emanating from it should not have been ignored and Muslim society should have been provided with an antidote for this poison. But who

was to undertake this task? The class that had received a Western-style education disliked sectarianism; the Muslim League members in particular realized the value of unity among the Muslims. The Muslim League leaders thought that the Muslims who had created Pakistan would not fall victim to such ignorance as to forget the Pakistan movement and start sectarianism. But the Muslim league leaders were proved wrong. Second, the Western-style educated class adopted the worst kind of reactionary principles in politics. All new things such as direct elections, provincial autonomy, and political parties were declared taboo; but while such a reactionary course was adopted in politics, in cultural life the blind imitation of the West became fashionable and an effort was made to cut off Muslims from their past. Some maintained that the Koran alone was sufficient [as a guide] and that the hadith [oral tradition] was not necessary. Others were of the view that since the Koran and hadith were available, why should one bother with fiqh [religious jurisprudence] and the exponents of religious laws. There were also those who professed belief in the Koran, hadith, and fiqh but repudiated mysticism and called it superstition.

The ordinary Muslim could not accept this new Islam of the modern innovators; and in spite of victory literature, the Ayub government and the efforts of movements opposing the brand of religion preached by the maulavis, the ordinary Muslim continued to regard the maulavis as the true representatives of Islam. [In the Sunni sect in Pakistan and India, the term malavi, in the best sense of the word, is used as an honorary title for religious scholars; and in the worst sense of the word, it implies self-styled religious scholars, reactionary and without much education; the equivalent of the term in its derogatory sense in the Shia sect in Iran is mullah used for reactionary, semiliterate and self-styled religious scholars]. In fact, the wrong kind of [religious] innovators pushed the Muslims in the direction of reactionary maulavis. Later, the maulavis raised the banner of democracy and became the defenders of national culture, national history and Islam; thus the maulavis triumphed over the innovators and as a result of this victory, the original Muslim League, which was created by the class educated in the Western style and by the supporters of modernism, came to an end and its place was taken by organizations of maulavis. These were not introduced from outside nor had they surfaced unexpectedly but had always existed in Muslim society. As soon as the Muslim League went bankrupt, these maulavi organizations came to the forefront.

The People's Party, which was enamoured of innovation, tried to take the place of the Muslim League but failed. Towards the end, Bhutto tried to save his life by joining forces with the maulavis, but they rejected him.

The emergence of the maulavis in Pakistani society was both good and bad. The maulavis were strongly biased in favor of their particular schools of thought and their exaggerated feelings influenced the ordinary Muslims. The class educated in the Western style was expected to

offer an alternative to maulavi leadership but failed to do so. If a new Islamic or Muslim leadership in the true sense of the word had emerged, it would not only have kept itself out of sectarian arguments and fighting but also would have prevented the nation from following a sectarian path. But no such Islamic or Muslim leadership emerged. The leaders and participants in the Islamic movement were themselves largely free of sectarian bias but they did not have the courage or ability to speak out against the major maulavis running factories of sectarianism. Thus, the factories remained active and gained strength in the 1970 elections.

Not all the maulavis wanted to stir up sectarian fighting. At the highest level, there was a desire for unity among the Muslims; but no formula was presented to promote this desire nor was any progress made towards achieving such a unity. Second, at the lower levels sectarian exuberance increased greatly. Jameat-i Ulema-i Hind and Majlis-i Ahrar were major organizations in Punjab and the frontier areas that played an important role in awakening the Muslims; but after suffering defeat at the hands of the Muslim League, these organizations underwent a distorting change of identity and one of the identities that emerged was that of the promoters of sectarianism.

A bad development that occurred was that the Shias in the government and the bureaucracy thought that they had power and considered it necessary to demonstrate this power, which produced a bad reaction. Then Zia came to power; he ignored the first-rank maulavis and Islamic leaders but raided the third and fourth ranks and abducted [seduced] the members to his side. In order to break up the parties, these individuals started to promote sectarianism, which became their tool of trade. As luck would have it, this promotion was still in its infancy when the Iraq-Iran war broke out and Arab embassies started to make high bids for the wares these promoters were selling. The Iranian Embassy countered by starting its own activity. In the beginning, the Iranians adopted the nonsectarian attitude of Khomeini. But for centuries, sectarianism in Iran has gone hand in hand with nationalism: thus, the "Islamism" of the Iranians did not remain uninfluenced by these factors and although not directly, the Iranians nevertheless encouraged sectarianism in Pakistan. The problem of sectarianism is not confined just to Tehran, Kabul, and Islamabad but now poses a challenge to Islam and the Muslims in the newly independent countries of Central Asia.

In order to confront the challenge of sectarianism, it is necessary:

1. To be realistic. It is not possible to do away with sects, for just as there cannot be nonparty politics, there cannot be a nonsectarian Islam. Sects have existed for centuries and will continue to exist in the future.

Sects are not evil in themselves; the evil arises when the interests of the different sects fail to harmonize resulting

in clashes; or when their way of thinking becomes devoid of the feelings of brotherhood and tolerance.

2. Religious leaders should be able to freely spread their brand of Islam and work for their particular school of thought; but, at the same time, they should make it clear to their followers that sectarianism is the work of the devil which they should avoid. Moreover, unity of purpose in Pakistan demands that Muslims abstain from sectarian dissensions and quarrels. Mosques and centers of religious activity should not become fields for sectarian strife. Religious leaders should also teach their followers that Islam places great emphasis on service and love for humanity and regards the shedding of one innocent person's blood tantamount to shedding the blood of all humanity.

3. For the sake of advancing their own limited political interests, political leaders should not compromise with and cater to sectarian elements. Sectarianism among the people should be unequivocally condemned, for without such condemnation sectarians will become powerful and politicians will find themselves left out in the cold.

4. Sectarian organizations put great pressure on newspapers, threatening to attack them if their statements and press releases are not published. The press should not bow to such pressures but should fight against it. It should not maintain a diplomatic silence regarding sectarianism but should instead carry out its duty of preparing public opinion to oppose sectarianism.

If these measures are not carried out, Pakistan, which is already caught in the whirlpool of linguistic prejudices in Sindh, will be drowned by sectarianism in Punjab and the Frontier province. It appears as though the waters of sectarianism are rising above our heads.

#### **Government Criticized on Failure To Islamicize**

92AS1112C Karachi JANG in Urdu 2 Jun 92 p 3

[Article by Sultan Safia: "Implementation of Islam-Today and Now-Otherwise Never"]

[Text] By the grace of Allah, Pakistan is a Muslim-majority nation and the people here love their religion dearly. Therefore, there cannot be two opinions about the need and benefits of establishing an Islamic form of government in Pakistan. The practical efforts made in this context are accelerated and slowed down with time. These changing attitudes show the "mood" of the changing political leadership and governments' ideologies. As far as Pakistani people are concerned, they have zealously supported an Islamic form of government as their first and last wish. They have not changed their stand on this issue under any circumstance or fear and even today they have spread their "heart's eyes" on the floor in its welcome. However, there is a faction (which is very small) in this country that is scared of the Islamization of Pakistan and considers it a "death warrant" for its political, group, and economic interests.

This group does not dare to openly oppose Islamization, but works behind the scenes consistently against it.

There is a separate history of Islamic efforts in Pakistan, which is full of turmoil as well as amazing. This country was established in the name of Islam and the main purpose of its establishment was described as implementation of the principles in the Koran. That is why the Muslims in India without asking anything in return had sacrificed their lives and properties to attain it. Even though some of our "friends" try to tell us that Quaid-e Azam, the founder of Pakistan, wanted to make it a secular state, a well-known statement made by Quaid-e Azam negates their claim. He had said, "Pakistan was established the day a non-Muslim was converted to Islam on this subcontinent." It is clear that Quaid-e Azam considered Pakistan and Islam to be mutually dependent. The other proof of this is that Quaid-e Azam had added the term "Islamic democracy" to Pakistan during his lifetime. After Quaid-e Azam's death, Liaqat Ali Khan also took this stand. He composed the "resolution of goals" with the help of religious scholars and had it approved by the Constitutional Assembly. At that time, it was decided to make Allah the owner of the nation and implement a government based on Koranic principles in Pakistan. Thus, the direction for the Pakistani Government was established. Later, Khawaja Nizamuddin and Chowdhery Mohammed Ali made further headway in this direction. During Ayub Khan's martial law regime, there were some discussions about removing the words, "Islamic Republic" before Pakistan, however, this proposal was shelved because of the fear of the people's angry reaction. Later, Mr. Bhutto declared Friday a weekly holiday and called a conference of Islamic leaders in Lahore in order to strengthen the "Islamic vision." At the same time, however, he also raised slogans of "Islamic socialism" and complicated this issue even further. During General Zia's presidency, a lot of progress was made implementing an Islamic form of government. He took some major steps and gave clear direction to this effort. These steps included starting restrictive ordinances, establishing the Islamic tax system, establishing the Salat system [facilitating five prayers daily], encouraging the work of the Islamic Ideology Council, establishing the federal *shari'ah* Court, and trying to change the present interest banking system to a noninterest banking system. As a next step, he wanted to start Qazi courts; however, he was called to God's house and left his work unfinished and without results. We are calling his job unfinished because all of these works and projects are still in the same shape, even today. The restrictive ordinances were implemented; however, the punishment suggested in this system were not implemented, because they were called "brutal and barbaric" and a lot of noise was made about them. The people who made this noise against the system are those who love Western culture and civilization and are not willing to accept anything in the name of their own motherland. The Zikoh system was limited to reducing the number of banks. The Salat system (an arrangement to pray in government offices and meetings) did not

continue for long. By calling the interest charged in business and banking "markups," they used the technique of selling old wine in new bottles, thinking that they had gotten rid of the system of interest on loans. Later, however, the Molvis and religious scholars broke this secret. Thus, everything is exactly as it was in the past. Still, the work that General Zia had done to implement Islam (such as canceling some laws that the Islamic Ideological Council had reviewed and replacing them and canceling some laws that the *shari'ah* court found inappropriate) are still effective. As a result of this, several revolutionary decisions were made in the federal *shari'ah* courts. The most important of these decisions was to replace the present interest system used in trade and banking with a noninterest system within a specific period.

The government that is in power in our country now was elected with the mandate of "the implementation of an Islamic government." (Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif was called Ziaul Haq's follower.) Therefore, on the outside, he also claimed to implement an Islamic form of government and gave proof of his honesty by establishing Bet al-Mal (Community Chest). However, because the ruling party (IJI [Islami Jamhoori Ittehad]) is a collection of people with conflicting ideologies, the parties that wanted to implement Islam (Jamaat-i Islami and Maulana Samih-ul Haq's Jamiat-i Ulema-i Islam) have left the IJI. Therefore, the ruling party is not so eager about implementing an Islamic form of government, as it was in the beginning. That is why we thought that the interest system would come to an end in our country, although nothing has been done about it because the ruling party is still suffering from confusion. According to news reports, the government is reviewing its decision and wants more time so that the federal *shari'ah* court can look into the whole affair (after studying mandates issued by various other Islamic nations). If this was true, then we would call it our ruling party's mood. And why should not this happen? The government has to pay the remaining debts, along with heavy interest, to foreign countries. In addition, it has taken out more loans to keep the work of the country going. Then, foreign investors have to start new industries and business here. The government also has to continue the process of privatization of those government industrial units that are running at a loss. Can not all this be done without the interest system? The people of our country will still understand. (However, they do not seem willing to do so.) How can we make foreigners understand that there can be no replacement for the interest system? What is more, we have heavy pressure from foreign economic agencies (the World Bank, IMF, and others). Meanwhile, we must also clean our image of the "curse" of fundamentalism that has been put on us by world powers. All of these affairs have combined to make our government a dunce. Now this government seems to have no alternative but to put the plan for an Islamic form of government on the back burner, and by calling it the "interest system," try to divert the people's attention from it. It has the excuse that it tried very hard, but that

it is not practical. The fact is that this excuse has been given to our government by our own people, as well as by outsiders. The words are from others, but the tongue is our own. However, before we say anything, we must evaluate it. Are we brave enough to say that the mandate issued by Allah is impractical? The things that Allah called taboo are not bad. We cannot give them up. At the same time, cannot we accept the things that Allah has said are appropriate? When they try to call the teachings and mandates of Islam inappropriate or impractical in this "time of progress," then the only thing we can conclude is that we are ready to revolt against God and his rules and are inviting a curse from Allah. If we pay a little more attention, we will notice that calling Islamic laws impractical or unacceptable is equivalent to deceiving ourselves and others. The main reason is that our intelligence is so hampered and our habits are so bad that we are not willing to tolerate any difficulty or hard work. It is our psychological and sexual needs force us to invent various excuses while the real reason is: [couplet] "If you do not want it from your heart, then thousands of reasonings will not change your mind."

There is no doubt that the path of Islam is a very difficult one. Those who follow this path have to relinquish and sacrifice a lot. Islam is just another name for hard work, sacrifices, and giving things up. It is against the fattened "body" that is controlled by desires. It stops a person from becoming a slave of his desires. It preaches patience and forbearance and educates one to be satisfied with very little. Anyone who claims and likes to be a Muslim will accept all of this with satisfaction. Otherwise, that person should look for another "house." In other words, [couplet] "Why should one go to the street of the person who loves her mind and life?" Islam is not something that can be divided so that one can pick what he likes and leave what he does not like. It has to be taken as a whole; there is no middle way. Meanwhile, plastic Muslims like us want [as the poet said] to "remain drunk all the time and still go to heaven." We want to talk about Islam all the time and at the same time, keep collecting land, property, and motor cars. Islam gives a very fundamental place to proper lifestyle. It does not allow alcohol, adultery, or interest near it at all. In Islam, those who are always involved in worldly things are called the "fuel for hell." Obviously, there will be some results when specific things have to be given up. We try to compare ourselves in every sphere with the people who think worldly goods are everything. For people of religion, worldly things are optional. Their priority is on the other world, and they are responsible for it. In other words, this world is just a stopping place for us, while our goal is the world at the other end. We spend our entire lives preparing for that other life. If we get less than what we need in this world and have to suffer frustration, then nothing is wrong. We should focus on the future and real life later. We should expect that the shortages we are facing here will be taken care of in the future. If we believe in that, then we will not worry about being left behind other people. We will bear our present problems and shortages with patience.

The impression that giving up the interest system and depending on proper religious living will cause us to die of hunger is totally wrong. The Almighty, who has the keys to the treasures of the whole world, will give us everything when He wants to do so. We will not be able to carry all that He will give us. Those who ridicule *shari'ah* restriction and the eradication of the interest system should take a look at Saudi Arabia. They will learn how Islamic restrictions have helped establish law and order there. They have been blessed with fountains of oil and unlimited deposits of gold from those deserts and dry, barren mountains. The people there do not feel any needs now. All this shows that any step taken in the name of God will be blessed with unparalleled success. The important thing is that our faith does not tell us that the Almighty is the World Bank or the IMF, any foreign government, or their investors. Instead, it is Allah, and only Allah, who protects us. If we put our faith in Him and follow the path that He told us to follow, we should not have any fear or danger. If we get little of our share in this present world, then God must have some reason for it. Perhaps He will make up this shortage in the next world, because "the most important luxury is being with God."

In our opinion, the time has come for our political leaders and the government to make a firm decision. Why were the Islamic Ideological Council and the federal *shari'ah* courts established? Were they established to work hard, only to have us ignore all their recommendations? Were the thick volumes of recommendations made by them only to become decorations in libraries and museums? When will we start to implement the recommendations made by these agencies by working hard around the clock? When will apply them to our lives? When will we allow ourselves and future generations to benefit from them? When will the social, educational, moral, political, and economic revolutions for which Pakistan was established occur? So many great sacrifices were made, and so many difficulties were borne by the people, but for what? The writer of these lines feels that if we are not successful in this task now, then we will never be successful, because the people of Pakistan are tired of the lip service given to Islamization. They want to see the results of these efforts as soon as possible. If time is wasted like this, then something will emerge that will not only be visible, but will also be felt. We should then be ready for the reaction to this action. That reaction will be in the form of disappointed people looking in other directions. The indications of such a change are already here. The secular forces are busy digging caves inside themselves. I hope that we do not wake up one day to learn that they have changed attitudes and that the idea of an Islamic form of government has been thrown out. The people have also given up their hope. May God prevent me from seeing such a day.

In our opinion, the time has come for political and religious leadership and the government to make a final decision on the Islamization of our country. They must

consider why the Islamic Ideological Council and the federal *shari'ah* courts were established. Were they asked to make all these efforts and decisions so that we could postpone or ignore them? Were the volumes prepared by these agencies, with recommendations for changes, made just to decorate libraries and museums? How long will we have to wait for Islamization in this life? When will that social, cultural, moral, and economic revolution for which Pakistan was established happen? Why are our rulers and political leaders waiting to implement Islam? Will they spend so much time that our new generation will be totally engrossed in the "new culture" and forget and lose their Islamic identity? Will our people become disappointed as they wait for the new morning that will bring Islam? Will we be affected by the secular people here and the so-called national and international philosophers and intellectuals that Islamization is unpractical in present times? If we continue to waste time this way and do not take advantage of the Pakistani people's natural love for Islam, then there is fear that the present Islamic climate in our country will gradually change. (There are indications of such changes in the air.) We will have to encounter a major "blowout." The IJI has a majority in the National Assembly and the Senate for the present, and we are not sure that this will continue into the future. Therefore, if the ruling party really loves Islam and is sincere in its promise, then it must take responsibility immediately. In our opinion, the present atmosphere is most conducive to such an action. If this work is not done today and now, then, God forbid, it will never be completed. The ruling party and the prime minister should know about this. Otherwise, they will be very sorry later.

#### **Islamic Fundamentalist Vision of Nation Assailed**

92AS1117A Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
11 Jun 92 p 7

[Article by Mubarik Ahmed: "The Ideology Syndrome"; quotation marks; italicized words as published]

[Text] Of late The Muslim has been articulating its views forthrightly in the editorial and leader columns on issues like fundamentalism, Islamic State, Islamic Laws and so on. These views are widely shared by the intelligentsia, though not so eloquently expressed for fear of a backlash from the powerful fundamentalist lobby.

The Muslim rightly deserves credit for enlightening its readers through a series of some highly thought-provoking articles/editorials, regardless of the 'fear psychosis' created by the fundamentalist (to borrow the phrase from Sardar Aseff Ali Ahmad).

Over the years how Pakistan drifted into the hands of orthodox elements whose interpretation of the genesis of Pakistan vastly differs from the vision which Quaid-i-Azam had, and how we got into the snare of illusive issues of ideology and the rest—the story is interesting and also revealing.

Quaid-i-Azam's perception of Pakistan as a secular democratic state is most clearly spelled out in his speech to the Constituent Assembly on 11 August 1947, which was supposed to be the guideline for the future shape of the Constitution of the Republic of Pakistan. There is no mention of any ideology in this speech. It is relevant to quote a passage from Justice Munir's book *Jinah to Zia*. For fifteen years after the establishment of Pakistan, the ideology of Pakistan was not known to anybody until in 1962, a solitary member of Jamaat-i-Islami for the first time used the word when the Political Parties Bill was being discussed in the Assembly... When he was asked to define ideology, he replied that the ideology of Pakistan is Islam.

Nobody asked him further question what is Islam?... Nobody can say anything to the contrary when Islam is mentioned." Since then the term ideology became a familiar parlance in our political debate.

Interestingly the concept of Islamic State in its narrow sense was introduced six months after the death of Quaid-i-Azam, when Prime Minister Liaquat Ali Khan moved the Objectives Resolution in the Constituent Assembly. It is inconceivable if Quaid would have given his assent to the Objectives Resolution if it had been passed in his lifetime.

With the introduction of this Resolution which was made a Preamble to the first Constitution, the clergy hogged the political stage of Pakistan, and since then they have been working insidiously to enlarge their power and influence. Their efforts were crowned with success when they abetted Zia to turn Pakistan into a fully theocratic state—an idea most reprehensible to Quaid-i-Azam, who on numerous occasions expressed his revulsion to a theocratic state.

The issue of an Islamic state and the definition of Muslim was analysed threadbare during the inquiry constituted to investigate the causes of Punjab Disturbances in 1953.

The inquiry committee comprised of Justice Munir and Justice Kyani—the two eminent jurists of Pakistan. This historic report conclusively proved that no two *ulema* out of hundreds who appeared before the tribunal, including Maulana Modoodi, agreed on a common definition of a Muslim or the Islamic state. Their interpretation exposed the shallowness of their knowledge and narrowmindedness of their vision. Their arguments were utterly irrational and contradictory.

There is no consensus, even today, among the *mullahs* despite their hold over the power structure. They do not agree on a matter as simple as sighting of the Eid moon. It won't be less than a miracle when they will reach a consensus on delicate issues relating to Islamic jurisprudence. The supreme irony is that these very *mullahs* who vilified Quaid-i-Azam and opposed the creation of Pakistan to the hilt, have now ascended to a position where they have almost destroyed Jinnah's conception of Pakistan.

In the struggle for Pakistan, the issues involved were not about religion in the ritualistic or dogmatic sense, but religion in a much broader sociological sense which Quaid-i-Azam described as a brotherhood, equality, fraternity of man." "These are the basic points of our religion, culture and civilization," said Jinnah, "and we fought for Pakistan because there was a denial of these human rights in the subcontinent." No matter how vehemently the *mullahs* may denounce it, secularism in the sense of tolerance and the rejection of theocracy is inherent in Islamic political culture.

From the interview which the Quaid gave to Reuter's correspondent in New Delhi in 1946, it is more than evident that his vision of Pakistan was a secular democratic state, when he said, "The new state would be a modern democratic state with sovereignty in the people and the members of the new nation having equal rights of citizenship regardless of their religion, caste or creed."

In the aftermath of partition, a massive communal carnage led to an equally massive cross migration thus changing the demographic complexion of the two states.

According to an estimate, if there had been no cross migration and non-Muslims had stayed on in Pakistan, they would have constituted thirty percent of the total population of West Pakistan. It is inconceivable that a leader like Jinnah would have made thirty percent population as inferior citizens in a religious state.

With a view to dispelling the fear of minorities, the Quaid while addressing the Constituent Assembly on 11 August 1947 said, "We are starting in the days when there is no discrimination between one caste or creed and another.

We are starting with this fundamental principle that we are all citizens and equal citizens of one state." He wanted the minorities to be integrated in the national mainstream while preserving their religious and cultural identity.

On the occasion of Pakistan Day celebration, soon after partition, he specifically instructed his staff to include all local Hindu notables of Karachi among the list of distinguished invitees. On 16 August 1947, Quaid-i-Azam along with his sister Fatima Jinnah, attended a church service at Karachi. The service was dedicated to the strength and well-being of Pakistan.

These apparently trivial examples are not without significance. They reflected an abiding concern of the Quaid-i-Azam for the integration of various religious groups in the new state of Pakistan.

Years later, these minorities whom the Quaid declared to be "citizens with equal rights, privileges and obligations," were made second class citizens, when Zia promulgated separate electorate system for the non-Muslim population.

It is time our leaders stopped orchestrating the ideological theme and get down to solving issues like increasing

regional polarisation, social inequalities and economic imbalances in the society. Let us not forget, when the former East Pakistan broke away, the ideology proved too tenuous a bond to keep the country intact. The issues were socio-economic, giving rise to Bengali nationalism which tore Pakistan apart.

### **Commentary Condemns Religious Fanaticism**

92AS1158A Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
17 Jun 92 p 6

[Article: "Instruments of Darkness Striking at Our Roots"]

[Text] What is this Islamic Republic of Pakistan coming to? Nobody knows how many Muslims killed each other in Gilgit during the latest wave of religious frenzy. The authorities seldom tell the truth about the number of the dead. Not that numbers make a lot of qualitative difference to what is now fast becoming a national disease or pastime. Depends on how you care to look at it. Gilgit was mentioned only as an example. Perhaps Jhang presents a much more shocking portrait of Pakistan's deteriorating sense of tolerance in religious matters. Northern Areas of Pakistan, once a haven of peace and unspoilt charms of nature, are now tainted with innocent human blood, spilled in the name of God. Karachi does everything on a big scale, so sectarian lunacy in that city usually shakes the metropolis more or less like an earthquake. The walls in all cities of Pakistan, big or small, present a vivid picture of the vile nature of our national psyche as it is today: murderous hatred of any point of view other than one's own. Few aberrations demean mankind so utterly as religious fanaticism, bigotry and intolerance so intense as to provoke man to kill man. It is perhaps possible to explain a man taking the life of another fellow being for, so to speak, gold, woman or land. But the religious fanatic kills a total stranger against whom he has no definable complaint or grudge. In most cases, the killer and killed have never had anything whatsoever to do with each other. This is murder most foul. And today we have an epidemic of such murders on our hands. This hideous phenomenon is not as simple or straight as it might seem. Nor is it a sudden eruption of violence. There is an inevitability about it. Its origins are to be found in that deceptively innocent—even noble!—document unwisely accepted as the "Objectives Resolution." It took an unconscionably long time to compose for the simple reason that it was to be so drafted as to mean entirely different things to people of entirely different and irreconcilable ideas, persuasions and beliefs. Why this marvel of confusing inanity was at all needed is quite clear now. Two major reasons stand out: first, to be used as an excuse to delay the preparation of the fundamental law (constitution) of Pakistan; second, to have an instrument to fool the people. Both purposes have been served but not without causing devastating distortions to the nation's processes of thought and feeling. It was this "Objectives Resolution," later to be discovered as little short of a hoax, which has subverted our civilised religious sensibilities.

Instead of becoming generous, accommodating, tolerant, we have become beings dangerously close to savages on issues with the remotest possible religious undertones.

If the history of Muslim glories tells us anything at all, it is simply that high-minded and tolerant Muslims have been sources of light and heroes of noble pursuits. Clergy-ridden courts have been hot beds of intrigue and the final result has been the decline and fall of the Muslim society under this curse. We are now fast running under that dark cloud. And for the most part of this tragedy, too terrible to contemplate, it is the Zia dictatorship which is responsible. Having no constituency of his own, and most probably driven by an excruciatingly guilty conscience, Zia released the imp from the bottle. His camp followers, mostly of small scheming minds, thought this was a stroke of genius. A stroke it certainly has turned out to be but one which is hacking away at the roots of sanity in Pakistan. Make no mistake. We are on the verge of becoming a demented—not Islamised—nation. We have never been farther from the spirit and substance of true message and purpose of our faith than today.

Has it occurred to any thoughtful citizen that the amount of campaigning which the deadly rival religious groups have been conducting for several years now cost a pretty penny? Who is financing this fanatical warfare? You cannot have thousands of miles of walls in the cities painted with the most villainously provocative humbug without somebody paying for this incendiary obscenities. Almost every known and not so well known sect has been

dubbed as Kafirs by their rivals and vice versa. Going by these writings on the walls all over the country, one is left with no choice but to conclude that we have arrived at a point where the Islamic Republic of Pakistan is populated by none but Kafirs. What a noble achievement!

It would not be wise to leave this horrifying situation as a bad joke, better not talked about. This is a very real problem. And if there are any really dangerous trends in our life today, this is the most pernicious of them all. One should not be surprised that the much talked of "foreign hand" is operating here more effectively than in any other arena. The surest way to destabilise a consciously Muslim community is to sow the seeds of sectarian discord. You just strike a matchstick and leave the haystack of sectarian lunacy to burn till everything is reduced to cinders and ashes.

O, sensible fellow citizens wake up to this danger. The fires have started raging. The flames are spreading. Undercover enemies of the peace and tranquillity are up and about. Some in flowing robes. We know as a matter of fact that until not very long ago, the professional Islamisers used to be financed from abroad. Among its not so well concealed sources were the United States and its surrogates. Who knows those forces are still operative? And who knows why they talk of all manner of foreign hands and inimical designs but maintain a steely silence on this point? This could not be without some sinister reason. Whatever be the case, there is no longer any denying that sectarian conflict in Pakistan is now posing the gravest danger to this country's peace, integrity and honour as a civilised society.

**Minister Malik Naeem Khan Announces Trade Policy**

92AS1167C Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
1 Jul 92 p 10

[Text] Islamabad, June 30—Following are the highlights of the trade policy as announced by the Commerce Minister Malik Naeem Khan Tuesday evening.

- The trade policy has been conceived on the basic principles of achieving liberalisation, deregulation and privatisation.
- The priority is being given to boost exports on non-traditional items as presently 70 percent of export earning are derived from rice and cotton.
- Liberalisation of imports will be pursued and protection is given to indigenous industry through tariffs.
- Recession in North America and slowdown of economic expansion in Western Europe and lower prices for a number of commodities slowed down Pakistan's export growth and earnings.
- Exports in the 11 months of the current year have touched U.S. dollar 6,140 million registering a growth rate of 14 percent. It is hoped that by the end of the current year, this rate would increase to 15 percent and export earnings reach a level of seven billion.
- Textile products like cotton cloth, hosiery, readymade garments, bed wear and towels show a growth rate of 18 percent. However, there has been a decline of seven percent in export earnings from yarn.
- The average unit prices of both rice and cotton show a sizeable fall, but in value terms exports of rice registered an increase of 25 percent and cotton 51 percent.
- The production of cotton in country increased from 9.6 million bales in 1990 to almost 13 million bales in [date indistinct].
- Exports of tents and canvass, tanned leather, fruits and vegetables showed a declining trend.
- Import Bill in the first 11 months of this year was 8,399 million U.S. dollars, representing an increase of 20 percent as compared to last year. By the year end, the import Bill is expected to be 9,200 million dollars.
- Leather products, synthetic textiles, sports goods and surgical instruments and other miscellaneous products registered positive growth.
- The increase in the import bill has been mainly due to the import of capital machinery which at 2,299 million dollars is 59 percent more in eleven months as compared to the corresponding period last year.
- System of fixed withholding tax on exports has been adopted in the budget for 1992-93 for a simple frictionless system of taxation.

- To encourage setting up of export-oriented industries, special industrial zones having all basic facilities like water, gas and telecommunications will be set up and will be given, besides concessions like exemption of customs duty and surcharge and reduced import licence fee on machinery will be available provided at least 60 percent of production is exported and there is at least 40 percent foreign investment.
- The maximum tariff rates for promotion of exports has been reduced from 90 to 80 percent.
- To improve the scheme of export processing unit if 50 percent of its products are exported in the first two years and 60 percent in the third year and beyond.
- Raw materials for processing from outside the bond have been permitted on basis of existing controls used for exports.
- Bond storage period for imported accessories has been extended from existing one year to two years. For raw materials and accessories imported free of cost or on credit, the period will be three years.
- Industries operating through bonds now allowed to import materials and accessories against advance licenses if 50 percent of previous liability will have to be redeemed after a period of two years.
- Requirements of import permit for imports of freely importable items under SRO [Statutory Rules and Orders] 68, 69 and 722 has been abolished.
- The trade policy provides for zero-rated import of machinery spares and accessories for the value added textile industries. Now it has been extended to sports, cutlery and surgical equipment industries.
- Import of machinery, spares and accessories for cutlery industry has been allowed free of customs duty, Iqra surcharge and import licence fee.
- To boost export of sports goods, import of willow and cork has been allowed at a net duty of five percent while import of unstrung rackets has been allowed for re-export after these are strung.
- Import of combing machines has been allowed at zero customs duty, five percent Iqra surcharge and six percent import licence fee.
- Duty on export of cotton above 40 counts has been reduced by 50 percent while import duty on cotton year of 60 counts and above has been reduced from 50 percent to total incidence of 16 percent.
- To boost export of farm products, the exporters of fresh fruits/vegetables have been given facility of duty drawback on packing material.
- Live plants, seeds of vegetables, fruits, flowers allowed free duty, surcharge, sales tax and import licence fee.

- Freight subsidy up to 25 percent of the actual freight paid on export of fruits, vegetables shall be paid provided these are sent through PIA [Pakistan International Airlines] or PNSC [Pakistan National Shipping Corporation].
- To develop three way trade, three way merchant trading through back to back L/Cs for crude oil, wheat, rubber, cotton, tea, sugar and fertiliser for re-export
- A committee comprising Secretaries of Ministries of Commerce, Defence, Communications and Railways has been set up to redress problems relating to cargo and telecommunication
- Labour laws applicable to export processing zones will be made applicable to all export-oriented units.
- To promote export of engineering goods, additional facilities are being provided to the export of engineering items
- Import of seasoning plants required by wood furniture industry has been exempted from levy of customs duty, Iqra surcharge and import licence fee
- 25 percent freight subsidy would be given to ceramics if shipped on PNSC vessels
- Five percent net import duty levied on synthetic stones and base metal clad with silver
- Under the export credit guarantee scheme, the base capital has been enhanced from rupees three crore to rupees fifty crore over a period of five years
- Dry fruits imported from Afghanistan may be allowed to be re-exported against submission of bank guarantee equivalent to the value of customs duty, Iqra surcharge and sales tax
- Import of footwear machinery, spares and accessories has been allowed without payment of customs duty Iqra surcharge and import licence fee
- Prime Minister's award for excellence and achievements in exports have been instituted
- Export licences will be issued with initial validity of one year instead of three months
- 21 more items have been removed from the negative list for liberalisation of imports
- Banks and security companies have been allowed import of armoured security vans
- Distinction between industrial and commercial importers for the purpose of tariff has been removed
- Import of asbestos and three chemicals which could be used in the manufacture of narcotics has been restricted to industrial consumers only
- Import licence for other items other than machinery with initial validity of 12 months has been extended to two years on additional payment of 0.25 percent of the unutilised value of the licences for each six months
- Import on consignment basis has been allowed to take advantage of deferred payment arrangements.—APP

### Sindh Economy, Development Efforts Viewed

#### Budget Reviewed

924S11704 Karachi JANG in Urdu 12 Jun 92 p 1

[Article by Agha Masood Hussein: "A Look at Sindh's Budget"]

[Text] The economy of a developing country changes like the seasons, sometimes the economy is good, sometimes it is bad. Since working conditions in these countries are not satisfactory, economic progress does not follow a consistent pattern, consequently, social and economic problems in these countries have become so serious that there does not appear to be any hope for solutions in the near future. Sindh is Pakistan's second-most important province from the point of view of population. It is blessed with vast natural resources, but because of the lack of facilities and the neglect of the rural populations these resources have not been utilized for the welfare of the people and the progress of the province. At the present time, the total revenue of the Sindh province, which is mostly obtained from taxation, is about 8 billion rupees; the province receives an additional 19 billion rupees from the federal government, about 8 billion of which is returned to the federal government as interest payments and 9 billion rupees are spent on the salaries and allowances of public employees. Thus very little money is left for development projects. However, Sindh has been receiving oil and gas royalties during the last two years and this money is being used for development work in the province. The federal government has given 10 billion rupees for Sindh's development and this money is being used in an effort to improve education and health standards. Several job related projects have been started in rural areas

In the budget for the fiscal year 1992-93, the largest amount (in the development sector) has been allocated to health and education, which have been given more money than last year. This shows that the provincial government has decided to raise the standard of health in the province and wants to make education available to everyone, thus increasing the potential for economic and social progress in the province. In the new fiscal year, the construction of a maternity hospital in Omarkot in Thar will make life much easier for the inhabitants of that area and reduce the high mortality rate in child birth caused by a lack of medical facilities and doctors. A new sanitarium for tuberculosis patients is being established in Davoud, which has a high incidence of tuberculosis (particularly of the lungs), will offer modern methods of treatment to patients close to their village. In the new

budget, provision has been made for a new cancer hospital in Karachi, which will provide treatment and carry out research on this fatal disease. Several hundred primary schools will be started in large districts and villages particularly for girls so as to educate them and make them aware of their role in society's well being, for without educated women, there can be no sweeping changes in social thinking. In their reports, the IMF and World Bank have emphatically recommended that all developing countries allocate half of their resources to health and education; hence, in Sindh a social action program is being started similar to the federal one with a budget of 20 million 500,000 rupees under which health and education facilities in rural areas will be improved. Equality can be achieved in Pakistan's development only when greater attention is paid to those areas that suffer from economic depression and lack of health and educational facilities. The hope of stable and all around progress can be realized only when the undeveloped areas of the country are brought up the level of the developed areas. Many parts of Sindh lack basic health, education and employment facilities. The scarcity of water and high levels of salinity in the soil have severely affected agricultural progress. Rampant corruption in the Irrigation Department has resulted in lack of attention to the equitable distribution of water and such things as the cleaning of water canals. Agriculture is suffering, almost 80 percent of the land in Sindh has become uncultivable due to high salinity. In order to make the land cultivable again, it is necessary to use modern technology in addition to traditional methods otherwise the remaining 20 percent also will become uncultivable.

The total Sindh budget for the current year is 26 billion rupees (including the 5 billion development budget); no new taxes have been levied and this is a surplus budget of 1 billion 405 million 500,000 rupees. It is good practice not to impose taxes but to leave profit making businesses untaxed is a disservice to the national interests. For example, taxing agricultural income is a provincial issue but provinces have remained silent on this important matter or one should rather say, have been intimidated by the social and political power of large landowners; hence, no tax has been levied on agricultural income. By taxing such income, the Sindh government can add several million rupees in revenue which can then be spent on education, health, and highway construction. Additional revenue will allow the exploitation of underground wealth that needs the use of technology. The provincial government should also encourage industry in Sindh which has been gradually falling into ruin since (perhaps 1986) when thieves and terrorists have held Sindh hostage. In other provinces, industrialization is proceeding at a satisfactory pace and the inhabitants of Sindh are realizing that their province has lost its former status in trade and economic progress. If this situation is not remedied soon, social deprivation in Sindh province can give rise to other more serious problems. In today's world, economic progress creates political stability and keeps the people united. Social deprivation creates social

anarchy and shakes the foundations of the political and social order. The people, especially the rural inhabitants of Sindh, should keep a close watch on elements in their areas who, on the orders of others, are destroying the peace and progress of the province. If social conditions in Sindh especially the law-and-order situation does not improve in the next few months, the inhabitants will be faced with greater hardships.

Fifty-seven thousand new jobs have been promised in Sindh's new annual budget; last year as well 50,000 new jobs were to have been created but after a few hundred posts were filled, lack of money ended any new recruitments creating great disappointment among unemployed educated youth. The government is again promising to create 57,000 new jobs but no one can give assurance that all the jobs will be filled. It is thus the duty of Liaqat Jatoi, the provincial minister of finance, to assure the people that all the new posts will be filled and will be made available on the basis of need as well as merit. I would suggest that the Sindh government obtain job applications from all educated unemployed youth in Sindh, enter the data into computers, and give employment to these youths on the basis of their record as soon as possible. The government should include the private sector in its job creation efforts and place some of the responsibility on the private sector. At present, the government is the major source of jobs but the private sector should come to the aid of the government and by expanding industry and trade, help to end unemployment. At any rate, Sindh's new fiscal budget is a balanced one but it has little to offer in the way of pointing out new sources of revenue. The federal grant of 19 billion rupees is also inadequate and the government of Sindh should ask for a larger federal grant in order to be able to solve the problems of the province in a far sighted manner. Unless the pace of development picks up in this province (and this depends on law and order also), its problems will remain unsolved. In addition to the government's practical measures, the people also should resolve to change the situation. The people of the province have mortgaged their fate to the government and its administrators and are waiting to see conditions improve; however, if the people should instead unite and challenge the enemies of society, there is no reason why conditions should not improve and allow the citizens to live again in peace and tranquility.

#### **Large-Scale Development To Commence**

92AS1170B Karachi AMN in Urdu 17 Jun 92 p 2

[Editorial: "Sindh's Rapid Progress"]

[Text] Sindh's provincial cabinet met under the chairmanship of the chief minister, Sayed Muzaffar Hussain Shah, to review the province's social and economic progress; Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif has already promised to provide federal aid. The provincial cabinet decided in its meeting to improve the standard of

development work and to establish a system of supervision for such work. It was also decided to give final shape this month to the Sindh construction program.

It is the responsibility of the Sindh government to give speedy approval to development projects and to establish an effective system of work supervision. It is customary to establish a deadline for the completion of such projects but the lack of effective supervision has delayed the completion of work within the specified period or the work done has been defective and substandard. Improvement in the system of supervision will allow development projects to be finished on time and raise the standard of work performed.

Ministers should supervise their own departmental projects; entrusting this responsibility to secretaries, divisional officers or district officers opens the door to corruption.

Since the social and economic development program is being started in Sindh on a large scale, it is necessary that the chief minister appoint an advisory committee for each ministry composed of the members of the assembly who would periodically visit the sites of the development projects and see how the work is progressing. In order to render these committees more effective, members of the opposition party also should be included.

The government wants to build new schools, more roads, new health units, add beds in hospitals, increase the number of government-run buses, and bring electricity to 800 more villages. The sites for these social and economic development projects are yet to be selected. It would be a good idea if the projects were divided equally among the province's four divisions: Karachi, Hyderabad, Sukkur, and Larkana but there is no harm in allocating more development projects to the backward areas in order to raise them to the level of the more developed regions. Better results will be obtained if the development projects are undertaken on the recommendations of the members of the assembly because the assembly members are well-acquainted with the needs and problems of their constituencies. Groups should be formed each consisting of the assembly members from a division and asked to recommend development projects and point out areas that need such projects. Each divisional group should include all the members of the assembly from that division irrespective of their party affiliation. A similar method has been adopted by the federal government for its development of the country program. The aim is to undertake development projects in each area on the basis of the recommendations of the assembly member from that area. The provincial government no longer faces a shortage of funds; the prime minister has already announced the federal government's willingness to give additional funds to Sindh if needed for economic and social development. It now remains to be seen how fast the Sindh government pushes Sindh's progress.

### Imports Increase 20 Percent in Fiscal 1992-93

BK1507110392 Islamabad THE NEWS in English  
15 Jul 92 p 12

[Text] Islamabad—Pakistan's import bill for fiscal year 1992-93 has increased by 20 percent as compared to the last financial year. As per trade data available, Pakistan's imports increased from \$7.6 billion [U.S. dollars] in 1990-91 to \$9.1 billion in 1991-92.

Exports have, however, shown an increase of only 11 percent from \$6.1 billion in 1990-91 to \$6.8 billion during 1991-92. The trade gap has, therefore, further widened from \$1.5 billion in 1990-1991 to \$2.3 billion during 1991-92.

There has been an increase of about 57 percent in the import of machinery in 1991-92. This indicates an accelerated pace of industrialisation in the country. It will not be out of place to mention that Pakistan imported tea worth \$1.70 million and wheat worth \$340 million, pulses worth \$58 million, edible oil worth \$400 million during the year 1991-92.

### Federal Budget, Military Expenditures Criticized

92AS1113C Lahore NDA-E-KHILAFAT in Urdu  
25 May 92 p 17

[Article by Abdul-Karim Abid: "Handicapped Government Cannot Provide Robust Economy Big Portion of the New Budget Will Be Squandered by Foreign Investors"]

[Text] Will we ever see a budget in Pakistan's history that would usher in a new era of development and prosperity? Even forceful leaders who used to boast could not offer such a budget. They succumbed to the vested interests of businessmen, industrialists, landlords, foreign investors, and international financial institutions. After such forceful leaders, a revolutionary budget was not even expected of the current, impotent leaders. Thus the new budget is one of handicapped and powerless leaders who do not have the courage to take concrete steps toward prosperity and development.

Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif has declared this budget a poor man's budget, but the only link between the two is that this budget has created hardships for the poor. Mrs. Benazir complains that this budget is for industrial and business communities. The business community complains that this budget was designed to please landlords and farmers because it does not include the agriculture tax. Mr. Zahid Sarfraz states that this is a bureaucratic budget. But has there ever been a budget in Pakistan that was not prepared by bureaucrats? Once Professor Khurshid Ahmad was given the responsibility to head the Planning Commission, but President Zia quickly realized his mistake and as usual this responsibility was shifted to Ghulam Ishaq. Our present finance minister,

## ECONOMIC

Sardar Aziz, is also a representative of the grand bureaucratic, namely, President Ishaq Khan, otherwise what does Nawaz Sharif know about the complexities of budget and finance?

The total budget amounts to 3 trillion rupees [Rs.] and out of this, Rs. 1.75 trillion is appropriated for defense and debt service. In other words, 31 percent and 28 percent of the budget is earmarked for debt payments and defense respectively. Out of this 3 trillion rupees budget, only 3 billion rupees will be spent on education and Rs. 95 million on health care. Various accounting tricks were used to hide the budget deficit but still a budget deficit of at least Rs. 40 billion was exposed. In order to close this deficit at least 20 percent is being borrowed from overseas. Rs. 20 billion will be raised through new taxes, and on top of that billions are being borrowed from private banks at high interest rates. Also, different types of bonds are being issued to raise revenues.

The foreign aid situation is such that the United States kindly gave \$310 million in assistance and took back \$350 million in principal and interest payments. Britain gave out \$30 million from one hand and took back \$41 million from the other. Similarly, France and Italy give out less and take in more. However, German and Japanese loans are still relatively small so net payments to these countries are less than what they give out in aid. Overall, \$1,649 million in loans was received and \$1,535 million was paid out. In other words, 94 percent of foreign loans are being spent on their repayments. Therefore, increasing emphasis is now placed on borrowing money from domestic sources and selling nationalized institutions.

It is interesting to note that the spending for the federal bureaucracy and cabinet has doubled. A widely read newspaper termed this as an Eid for the federal bureaucracy.<sup>7</sup> As an excuse to stop smuggling, custom duties have been reduced on televisions, refrigerators, air conditioners, and cosmetics to please multinational institutions. At the urging of the IMF and the World Bank subsidies have also been cut.

The bureaucratic elite has always tried to prepare lower estimates for spending and higher estimates for revenue. During the current year Rs. 1,230 billion was projected in spending, but it turned out to be Rs. 1,245 billion. Likewise, estimates for revenue fell short by Rs. 7 billion. Once again, wrong estimates are being prepared to disclose the lowest possible deficit. It is being said that poor are not being subjected to this tax burden, but direct taxes only amount to Rs. 3 billion and indirect taxes amount to Rs. 14 billion.<sup>8</sup> The burden of indirect taxes will fall on ordinary people. An inflation rate of 12.5 percent for last year and 10.5 percent for this year was officially acknowledged. We are told that next year it will be even lower. But all of us know the truth, that this monstrous inflation will not stay under control and will continue to spread its ill effects. Even Western educators

do not have a cure for inflation, so how will their bureaucratic students find a cure for it?

The biggest problem is that after spending Rs. 92 billion in foreign loan payments and Rs. 82 billion on defense, not much is left for planning. Besides the bureaucratic segment needs a lot of pampering. Dr. Mahbub Ul-Haq, an ex-finance minister who is currently serving as an advisor to the United Nations, has prepared a 210-page long report. According to this report, representatives from different segments within Pakistani society should develop a social and human agenda for spending through consensus. The budget process should be depoliticized and a debate should be held on it in the National Assembly that would empower the government to take sensible steps. At present, Pakistan's name is included in the list of 100 countries where defense and social budgets are unequally uneven. Soldiers outnumber doctors by four to one. We are not ready for the 21st century which will belong to technology. Only 16 percent of our population receives an education in science and technology. An increase in per capita income will not solve the problem either—Saudi Arabia has a high per capita income but in literacy it is behind Sri Lanka.

Dr. Mahbub Ul-Haq has proposed that if SAARC (South Asian Association of Regional Cooperation) countries would agree to freeze their defense budgets at current levels, these countries would be able to get \$300 million for social development. The issue is how and why such an agreement would take place? The World Bank and IMF have put considerable pressure on Pakistan to reduce its defense spending. But unless conflict with India is resolved, defense spending in South Asia cannot be reduced and will not be reduced. Consequently these countries will keep on sinking in the vicious circle of destruction. A strong government is needed to negotiate an agreement with India. The present government is so weak that it is a constant threat to its survival. This government is akin to using aspirin to cure cancer because it is not willing to dispense anyone. That is why, administrative spending for 1991-92 was 24 percent higher than 1988-89 and even this figure was raised to 30 percent by the end of 1991-92 fiscal year. Once again spending is being increased by 14 percent and in reality, this figure will increase even further and will be financed through minibudgets.

Because of increased spending, it is impossible to reduce the deficit. The government does not have the courage to force its administrative staff to reduce spending and face public anger. If we include semigovernment institutions in deficit calculations, the national deficit is at least Rs. 114 billion. Although Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif keeps on preaching his philosophy that a good government is a less government, he still does not have the courage to act on his own philosophy.<sup>9</sup>

The British imperialist system that we inherited is not just intact but our rulers have made many new additions to it, and it is not easy to challenge it. Our administrative

apparatus is not only massive but it is also useless and cannot meet today's demands.

If defense spending continues to increase at this rate, then we would not need an enemy to destroy us. Instead, just like Russia, we will die under the burden of our own defense spending. Defense spending should not be unlimited or unaccountable. Obviously, Nawaz Sharif's weak government can only rubber stamp army general's demands for defense spending, and his crippled Muslim League is not capable of formulating any plan to include the general public so that defense spending can be reduced. It is not even possible for a civil administration to audit military procurement.

The only thing that the government has done for the poor is that before this budget it allowed a price increase of Rs. 2.50 per kg for flour. Now the government has announced that food stamps will be issued to the poor to buy flour at a discount of Rs. 1 per kg. No one seems to understand this food-stamp scheme either. How is it going to be implemented? Will the poor ever benefit from it or once again will freeloaders hoard it? The government has claimed an economic growth rate of 6.4 percent and considers it a big success. But this growth is due to increased agricultural production and even that only in cotton crop. With the exception of cotton, the

growth rate for all other crops is stagnant and the manufacturing sector has not shown any signs of progress either. In fact, overall agricultural production has declined.

No one believes the finance minister's assertion that domestic investment has increased by 25 percent and several hundred thousand workers were employed. Investment has taken place on paper only and productivity has not increased. New job opportunities are not on the horizon either. A strange aspect of the budget process was that the government announced cuts in development spending and changes in tax laws in a press release. This is the first time that overnight changes were made in the budget and it exposes chaos within the government. Not long ago development spending used to make up 40 percent of the budget, it was only 25 percent in the current budget and later through a press release it was reduced to 23.5 percent of the total budget.

The new budget reveals that events are moving in an opposite direction and the government neither has any plan nor courage to bring any change. As long as political instability persists, regardless of who is governing, government will remain unstable and it will not have the courage or means to bring about any change.

### Bangladeshi Women Bought, Sold into Slavery

*U.S. News International THE MIRROR in English  
20 Jun 92 p 1*

[Text] A 1991 study by the National Council for Social Welfare in Pakistan estimates that 100 to 150 Bangladeshi women and girls are brought into Pakistan every month and many are sold against their will into prostitution, marriage or domestic servitude.

The average age of the female victims is 15. The majority have been lured from Bangladesh to Pakistan by promises of jobs, better pay and a better life. Some women have simply been abducted and, frequently, drugged. The traffickers include both women and men.

Their victims are brought by bus and train through India to Pakistan, or in many cases, having been transported to India and walk across the border into Pakistan. They often end up in brothels in Bangladeshi areas (slums) in Karachi, although as their numbers have risen they have been found in small towns throughout Pakistan.

They are held under terrible conditions. According to a recent report submitted to the United Nations Working Group on Contemporary Forms of Slavery, ill treatment, constant work and sexual harassment are their common experience and rape is not unusual. The pimps use threats of exposing the women's status as illegal immigrants or denouncing them under the Hudood laws to compel them to provide desired services. Those who resist are beaten, or worse.

Trafficking of Bangladeshi women into Pakistan for the purposes of domestic or sexual slavery has been going on for 10 or 15 years. It received considerable international attention through an interview by the Washington-based National Public Radio (NPR) with an 11- or 12-year-old Bangladeshi trafficking victim, Fatima, along with three other Bangladeshi women, she was discovered in Karachi Central Jail (KCI).

Fatima was kidnapped from her village in Bangladesh, compelled to walk to Pakistan, brought to Karachi, and forced into domestic service in a prostitution den, where she said she was repeatedly beaten by the pimp. She was arrested during a police sweep and, before being placed in KCI where she was interviewed by NPR, she spent two weeks in a police lock up in Karachi where she was allegedly beaten repeatedly by the police officers. According to a 1990 report of the Geneva-based Anti-Slavery Society, Fatima was hauled out of the KCI by a known female trafficker in women and has not been seen since.

In the early days of this growing female slave trade, when the number of victims was smaller and the phenomenon less well known, the sale of women and girls used to be blatantly advertised. Public auctions were held primarily in the Karachi slums. A Bangladeshi journalist who witnessed one such auction described it this way:

At night, girls were being brought to the slum and then auction took place indoors. There was no bidding as such because there was always an understanding between procurers and the customers before the auction. Usually the younger and more beautiful girls were sold quickly and at higher prices. The unmarried and virgin girls were sold for 15,000-20,000 taka. Also a group of 10-20 girls was sold together for 50,000 to 200,000 taka to brothel owners and pimps. Some girls were kept aside before the auction to be taken separately to hotels for wealthy buyers who were given the opportunity to inspect the girls individually. Men from the villages also came to seek wives. A Punjabi man gave 10,000 taka for an ordinary Bangladeshi girl. The auction ended. Those who were sold went with the buyers. The rest returned to the place they came from. Everyone remained silent. It seemed that the girls were helpless and speechless.

Since the early days, trafficking in women between Bangladesh and Pakistan has increased and, as public attention has been drawn to the problem, the practice of selling women has become more clandestine. In Karachi's teeming Bangladeshi slums, agents acting on behalf of pimps now keep the women and girls in dens and quietly trade them from these hostels.

A 1991 British Broadcasting Company (BBC) documentary focusing on trafficking in women in Pakistan interviewed a former Pakistani pimp who said there were anywhere from 150 to 200 girls in every den in the slum in which he operated. The BBC also interviewed a notorious local pimp, Bachua, who, though denying he was a pimp, admitted to keeping 8 to 9 Bangladeshi girl "tenants" in his house at any given time. According to a recent report prepared by the Karachi-based Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA), over 200,000 Bangladeshi women are currently in Pakistan as a result of trafficking, yet it remains a "hidden" problem.

Rather than continuing to auction the girls publicly, the pimps have taken to marrying them off, sometimes to the pimps themselves. This protects both the pimps and their clients from being charged under the Hudood laws, which, as noted, penalize, among other things, sex outside of marriage and can carry long prison terms and severe corporal punishment.

In an interview with a local Karachi daily, an infamous pimp, Sher Khan, who denied selling girls but was lately arrested for running a brothel, said:

I assist in the arrangement of a girl's marriage. It is a good deed. I collect the money from the bridegroom's parents and pay it to the girl's parents. The *mawali* pronounced *maach* and a simple ceremony takes place. Bangladeshi women who have been picked up during police raids of prostitution dens or who have escaped after being sold report that they were married rather than sold and that the exchange of money between the pimp and the buyer took the form of dowry.

A 1988 story in a Karachi daily documents the sale of a Bangladeshi woman in which a *queri* charged 500 rupees

to marry the girl to her buyer. Reportedly these husbands often buy the girls and then sell them again at a small profit.

At current prices and depending on the virginity, beauty and health of the girls and women, a sale can bring anywhere from US \$800 to US\$1,600.

As noted in a 1991 study of trafficking:

Both the Pakistani and Bangladeshi governments have ratified the 1926 Slavery Convention and the 1956 Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade and Any Practices Similar to Slavery, and thus have undertaken to suppress slavery in all its forms. Both governments are well aware of the rising flesh trade between their two countries, yet neither has done much about it.

In fact, rather than protecting the women and girls by arresting those accountable for their illegal sale and abuse, the Pakistani government is imprisoning the women and girls while allowing most brokers and pimps to go free. According to the National Welfare Survey, 1,400 Bangladeshi women and girls are currently in prison in Pakistan, ostensibly for entering the country illegally or for offenses under the Hudood Ordinances. According to the Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA), in November, 1991 there were 80 such women and girls in Karachi Central Jail, many of whom are pregnant or have children or infants who live with them in prison.

In many cases, Bangladeshi women arrested by police suffer prolonged detention, usually because of a lack of counsel or inadequate financial or personal resources to provide bail or surety. In many other cases, like Fatima's described above, the women are simply bailed out by the pimps and returned to the dens. Meanwhile, the pimps go free, while pimps involved in the sale of Bangladeshi women and girls have been arrested by the police, not one has ever been prosecuted and punished by the government for trafficking in women or for the abuses commonly associated with this practice. As noted by one local observer, the Pakistani government rather than dealing with the causes of the problem, seems bent on "victimizing the victims."

#### Cases

Several Bangladeshi women were interviewed in Lahore and Karachi who had been brought to Pakistan by traffickers and ended up being imprisoned, either on Hudood charges or for violations of Pakistan's immigration law. These women were interviewed after they had been released from prison.

In a Lahore case, the woman was awaiting the outcome of a Hudood case that had been lodged against her by her buyer from whom she had escaped. In Karachi, three young Bangladeshi women were in a local welfare center hoping to be repatriated to Bangladesh.

Shamim Akhtar, 20, in Lahore was from Dhaka, Bangladesh. She told that several men abducted her from outside her aunt's home in Dhaka and took her by train to New Delhi, India. She believes she was given drugs, since she was unconscious for the entire trip. From New Delhi they took a bus to an unknown place, got off and started walking to Pakistan. It took them 15 days. There were five men with her who she believes were from Pakistan. At the border, there was a police station with two other Bangladeshi women in it. The men spoke to the police but she did not understand what they said. They passed over the border.

Eventually, they made their way to a tailor shop in Sadikabad, Punjab, Pakistan. The man kept Shamim locked up in a room there for about 15 days, until they found a buyer. She was taken to the buyer's house and made to put her thumb print on a blank piece of paper which later turned out to be a marriage certificate. Shamim was with the buyer at his farm for over a year. One night, the mother of the buyer told Shamim that he had sold her to somebody else. She left the house that night and tried to commit suicide by attempting to drown herself in a stream. A passerby saved her and took her back to his house in Sadikabad.

She married the uncle of the man who rescued her and spent one year in Multan with him. Her buyer's brother discovered she was still alive and tried to get money from them, but they refused. He then went to his brother and told him that Shamim was still alive. In the meantime, Shamim and her husband moved to Lahore.

In August of that year, police came to her house in Lahore with her contract of marriage to the buyer, saying that she had been married twice. They took her and her husband to the police station and charged them with adultery under the Hudood Ordinances. They were jailed for three months. They both obtained bail and ultimately they were acquitted of the zina charge. However, the buyer has filed a suit for restitution of conjugal rights, while Shamim has filed a counter-suit for nullification of marriage: both cases are still proceedings.

Several Bangladeshi women were interviewed at the Edhi Center in Karachi. Edhi has frequently supplied bail and surety for women accused under the Hudood Ordinances, and the Edhi Home is the largest refuge for Bangladeshi women in Pakistan. As of October 1991, there were 80 Bangladeshi women and girls in the Edhi Center in Karachi and another 46 in the Edhi Lahore Center.

Neelofer at the Edhi Center in Karachi said that she had been working at a mill in Chittagong, Bangladesh, when a woman advised her that she could earn much more money in Bombay. The next day the woman took her and her younger sister Jasmeen, to meet a man who turned out to be a *dalal* pimp. Both sisters were told by the pimp that they would receive jobs as domestic servants.

They went from Chittagong to Jessore, Bangladesh by bus, took a train to India and then walked across the border to Pakistan. It took them a month to reach Karachi. Altogether there were more than 20 women in the group and four younger girls. In Karachi, they were brought to the pimp Bachuu's house in Ayesha Manzil. Women who complained or tried to return home were beaten, although Neelofar said she was not beaten. Men came to the house to buy the women. There were 40 to 50 women there.

The police raided the pimp's house after Neelofar had been there for ten days. She was kept in the police lock up for four days, and then taken before a magistrate and transferred to the Karachi Central Jail. She was charged with illegal immigration.

All the Bangladeshi women were kept together in the prison. One man was arrested in the raid, but not the pimp. The pimps used to come to the jail to tell the women that only the pimps could get them bail. While they were in prison, other Bangladeshi women were also brought there under arrest.

Rabia and Raheema were arrested in the same police raid. Raheema had been brought by her aunt to Lahore. A man came to the house where they were staying and, while her aunt was out, took her to Ayesha Manzil in Karachi with another group of women that included Rabia and Neelofar. None of the women in this group had been sold before the police raid.

The 1991 report by Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid on trafficking in women and children in Pakistan documents 13 cases of Bangladeshi women and girls who were brought to Pakistan against their will.

Nonetheless, the victims' stories suggest a pattern of illegal inducement, transport, abuse, sale and forced sexual and domestic servitude of women in violation of Pakistan's international obligations.

### **Women Said 'Disadvantaged, Exploited Lot'**

92AS1117G Karachi DAWN in English 5 Jun 92 pp I-II

[Article by Zubeida Mustafa: "The Status of Women: What Is the True State of Affairs?"; quotation marks as published]

[Text] The women's movement in Pakistan (I use the term for want of a more appropriate one) has lost its earlier vitality. The various organisations which came together under the umbrella of the Women's Action Forum to take up cudgels against an Establishment determined to suppress the female identity, have gone their separate ways.

This is distressing because a lot of work still remains to be done to raise the status of women. Admittedly, enormous progress has been made by a small minority of the female population in the country. In the last decade and a half since the international women's year in 1975,

women have achieved what was unheard of before. The number of girls enrolled in primary schools and in the universities has doubled and the female literacy rate has gone up by five percentage points in the last decade from 16 to 21 percent. Even the labour force participation ratio of women has risen from three percent to twelve percent in 1981-1991. Health-wise women's status has improved even though marginally, and the sex rate has risen from 90 (for 100 men) to 92.

More importantly, women are now entering fields from which they were excluded previously. We have had a woman prime minister. Today we have a woman head of a bank, a woman editor of a daily newspaper and many women engineers, architects, surgeons and even airline pilots.

Then why should there be concern? Because the induction of women in many of these erstwhile male preserves, welcome though it is, has not given them a voice in the decision-making process. Hardly any of them are in a position to transform the system which continues to be heavily biased in favour of men.

Then, it must be pointed out that the progress that has been recorded is confined to a minuscule minority which is privileged by virtue of its education, wealth or family tradition. The overwhelming majority of women in Pakistan continue to be a disadvantaged exploited lot. Their situation has not changed at all. The overall position of women is so dismal that it is at par with some of the poorest and most backward countries of Africa. In terms of Third World averages, Pakistani women are definitely way behind in literacy, education, health care, mortality rates and demographic indicators.

If U.N. statistics are to be believed, women in Pakistan have gone two steps backward after taking a step forward in the seventies. For instance, in 1981, 31 percent of girls in the 5-9 year age group were enrolled in schools. This ratio fell to 28 percent in 1988. If the absolute number of those enrolled has doubled, it is because of the colossal increase in the size of Pakistan's population. The number of girls out of school has increased even more. Take the crude birth rate which is a good indicator of the status of women in a society. This had begun to steadily decline since the sixties when the first official family planning programme was launched. In 1960 the CBR [Crude Birth Rate] was 49 per 1000. In 1982 it had come down to 42 only to shoot up again to 46 in 1989. Correspondingly, the total fertility rate (the average number of children a woman can have in her reproductive life) went up to 6.6 in 1989 after having fallen to 5.8 in 1982.

This is not surprising. The Ziaul Haq years were the darkest period in the history of Pakistani women. Laws were enacted in the name of Islamisation which not only cruelly discriminated against women but actually made them liable to be punished for crimes which they had not committed. For example, the promulgation of the Hudood Ordinance created a situation which has sent

more women to prison in Pakistan than ever before in the country's history. Many of them who are innocent still languish in jail because they are disadvantaged by poverty, illiteracy and social traditions.

Another devastating dimension of the martial law years which took women back several decades was the anti-feminine climate that was created. The establishment of the Women's Division in the Federal Government and loud proclamations of the rights granted to women by Islam notwithstanding, they were actually pushed back in an effort to confine them within the four walls of their homes. The slogan of *chadar aur chardivari* was raised to restrain women from coming forward to seek betterment. Female emancipation was checked by condemning the few who sought to provide leadership to women in their struggle to unshackle themselves as Westernised and alien to the indigenous culture. As though the Pakistani culture only consigns women to the dark backwaters of ignorance and servility.

The most disturbing aspect of the women's situation today is that this state of decay and retrogression which set in a decade ago continues to persist. In fact, the position is bleaker. Why? Firstly, politics has supplanted discussion on social and women's issues. Although this should not be so because such questions which are fundamental to our survival should be an integral part of politics. But the fact is that they are not, because of the bankruptcy of our politics. Hence in the absence of a focus for the struggle for women's rights which the military regime's blatantly anti-woman stance had provided, the response of the women's movement has also weakened considerably.

This is dangerous for the women's struggle. For while a small minority appears to be doing well, the condition of the majority is deteriorating and that too insidiously. As the women's movement has begun to flag in dynamism, the paradox is that it alone can revive public interest in the uplift of women. Given the thrust of the government's policy towards privatisation, it is futile to expect the public sector to be geared towards the betterment and progress of women.

The problem with many of the women's bodies is that they have concentrated mainly on consciousness raising and creating awareness among women of their rights. This is a key function the significance of which should not be downgraded. The fact is that until women assert themselves to achieve their rights and empower themselves, they will remain a downtrodden class. But consciousness without the necessary facilities to help women help themselves can prove to be quite frustrating.

It is in this context that the women's movement in Pakistan has failed. There are a number of agencies which are working to provide literacy, health care, employment opportunities and legal aid to women. They are rendering highly commendable service in their own areas and their contribution should not be belittled. They have, however, failed at the macro level. One

cannot help but note that they have not succeeded in generating a wider thrust towards change.

If attitudes had been sufficiently transformed, the dropout rate among female pupils would not have been so high—over 75 percent of the girls drop out of the school system after the primary level. It has not been possible to even sustain their enrolment in schools once their parents have been motivated to send their daughters to school.

The time has now come for the women's movement to concientedly strive for the empowerment of women. Consciousness raising was the first stage and it has certainly been marked with success. Even mobilising public opinion for the women's cause was a prime responsibility at a time when civil rights were non-existent under the martial law regime. Had this not been done, women would not have managed to hold on to many of the rights they had managed to win earlier after a hard struggle. Moreover, they would have been dragged into the dark chasms of obscurantism as they would have become hapless victims of the miscarriage of justice. How narrowly they escaped this fate thanks to the dynamism of the women's movement at that time was demonstrated in the Fahmida-Allah Bakhsh and the Shahida Parveen cases. Consciousness raising and mobilisation of public opinion were the factors that saved women in the blackest phase of their history. But now the time for the next stage has arrived. The immediate need is to provide the facilities which are necessary to capitalise on the awareness that has been created about the women's cause.

If women have been made aware of the importance of education for their personal, social and economic development, they must be provided schools where they can study and their absence from home for a few hours every day be facilitated. When they are taught about the significance of health care, sanitation and nutrition for their quality of life, medical facilities must be made accessible to them. When women learn about the impact of family size and the spacing of children on their own health and the health of their children, as well as their socio-economic emancipation, contraceptives should also be made available to them. Similarly, the importance of economic emancipation has little relevance if the employment generation process is neglected and no provision made for care for the working woman.

Here it must be emphasised that all this can be achieved if women are organised with a view to promoting their empowerment. Education must be central to this process. Thus alone can the women's movement ultimately come to be rooted in the middle class from where it must derive its strength and following, if it is to succeed. If this opportunity is allowed to go by default, all that has been achieved in the past decade will be irretrievably lost.

**Women in Custody Said Routinely Tortured, Abused**

92AS1206C Islamabad THE MUSLIM (Supplement) in English 26 Jun 92 p 1

[Quotation marks as published]

[Text] More than 70 percent women in police custody in Pakistan are subjected to physical and sexual abuse by law enforcement agents, yet not a single police official has been punished for such abuse.

This was noted in a 106-page report released by Asia Watch and Women's Rights Project, the two divisions of the New York-based Human Rights Watch. The report entitled "Double Jeopardy: Police Abuse in Pakistan," called upon the Pakistan government to put an end to impunity for crimes of custodial violence against women and to guarantee them equal protection of law.

The report says that Pakistani police deny women the basic protection due by law. Police often refuse to register rape complaints by women, particularly if the complaint implicates an officer.

According to a 1990 study of rape in Pakistan, "the police is notorious for delays or outright refusals to register FIRs (First Information Reports). While such treatment of a crime victim would be illegal and abusive under any circumstances, it has particularly serious ramifications for female rape victims. To file an FIR, rape victims must be medically examined in the presence of a police officer, preferably within 48 hours of the assault. If she is not examined, the rape victim must herself account for the delay, even when the FIR are impossible to obtain and evidence essential to prove a rape allegation may be lost. For example:

—On October 24, 1991, according to press reports, Jannat Bibi from the town of Kehrone Paccia was allegedly raped by eight armed men who broke into her house. The assailants cut off Jannat's nose and fled with her clothes. On October 25, a friend of Janaat's went to the local police station and tried to register a case of gang-rape, but the SHO (Station House Officer) refused. After two days the SHO registered a complaint, but described the crime as theft. Only after Janaat's case was widely publicised did the police relent, and 10 days after the incident, register a rape charge against her assailants.

—On July 30, 1989, Nazir Ahmed, his wife Anwar and sister Fatima of Mandi Bahauddin, were stopped by former employers who charged them with theft and denounced them to the local police. They were taken by police to the local station house, where the women were stripped naked by several officers, raped and had sticks inserted into their vaginas. The police delayed accompanying the women for a medical exam (which, though performed three days after the assault, supported allegations of repeated rape and sexual assault) and refused to register a case against the implicated officers. Only after press reports and a public demonstration did the police finally register a rape charge.

The delay or refusal to register FIRs when the victim or accused is a woman has become so commonplace that several regional High Courts have been compelled by the intervention of human rights lawyers to take suo motto notice of certain cases and to force local police to register FIRs. This appears to be true of custodial rape cases in particular. In one recent case, the Lahore High Court empowered itself to act as "police officers" and arrested four officers implicated in rape charges whom the police had refused to arrest.

Officers frequently illegally detain women in police lockup for days at a time without formally registering a charge against them or producing them before a magistrate within the prescribed 24-hour period.

Although women police officers are required for the arrest and interrogation of women, this rarely occurs. Thus, women prisoners are often held in custody indefinitely by male police officers without the knowledge of the courts. Most sexual abuse of female detainees occurs in these periods of "invisibility."

More than 60 percent of all female detainees are imprisoned under the hudood ordinances. Over 2,000 women currently are imprisoned under these laws alone. Although the acquittal rate for women in hudood cases is estimated at over 30 percent by the time a wrongfully prosecuted woman has been vindicated, she is likely to have spent months and in some cases years in prison says the report which is based in part on a two-week visit to Pakistan in October 1991.

Hundreds of Bangladeshi women too are currently jailed in Pakistan and subjected to similar treatment. These women are smuggled into the country at a rate of 100 to 150 a month and are forcibly sold into prostitution or domestic servitude. While the women are arrested by police as illegal immigrants or for Hudood offences, not a single person has been punished for trafficking in women.

To end custodial violence against women and eliminate gender discrimination, the Asia Watch and the Women's Rights Project offered a series of recommendations to the Pakistan government. These are:

—The government should prosecute criminally officers who engage in sexual or physical abuse of women in custody and should also guarantee women equality before and equal protection of the law.

—The government should repeal the Hudood Ordinances insofar as they fail to guarantee the full equality of women before the law, the right of women to testify and present evidence in court, the right of women to have their testimony given equal weight to that of men, and the right to be free of cruel and inhuman punishments such as flogging, amputation and stoning.

- The government should take immediate steps to enforce the laws and rules pertaining to the detention of women in police custody and to strengthen the capacity of state prosecutors to investigate and prosecute sexual and physical abuse of women in police custody.
- Police should be trained to recognize the criminality of violence against women and to eliminate custodial violence.
- The government should ensure that the judiciary gives high priority to eliminating impunity for crimes of custodial violence against women by making good-faith efforts to punish abusive police officers to the full extent of the law and administer the law without prejudice toward women.
- The Pakistani government should see to it that judges protect the basic rights of women to a fair trial and end practices that violate due process.
- The judiciary should exercise its authority to guarantee that women are not arbitrarily or illegally detained by ending the use of private facilities for detaining women who have not been formally charged and ensuring that a finding of probable cause for arrest is made in a timely manner so as to reduce wrongful prosecution, particularly for Hudood offenses. Judges should receive training on the criminality of violence against women and gender discrimination.
- The Pakistani government should make every effort to provide free legal assistance to indigent women and men.
- The Pakistani government should eliminate trafficking in women and make every effort to prosecute vigorously those involved in the forced transport and sale of women and girls for sexual or domestic servitude; investigate and prosecute police officers or other state agents implicated in trafficking or in the failure to investigate and arrest traffickers; and refrain from prosecuting involuntary victims of trafficking.
- To demonstrate its commitment to end custodial violence against women and to ensure women's rights to equality before the law and equal protection of the law, the Asia Watch has urged the Pakistani government to ratify the international agreements that protect women's human rights such as the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and its Optional Protocols, the Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women.

#### Rape, Torture, Humiliation of Women Said Commonplace

92AS1206A Islamabad THE MUSLIM (Supplement)  
in English 27 Jun 92 pp III

[Article by S.K. Kauser: "Two Cases Too Many"]

[Text] The protests rolled in starting with the larger cities of Karachi, Lahore and Islamabad. Wave after wave they rose and flowed through various cities of Pakistan, including Peshawar, Faisalabad and Abbottabad.

The cities conspicuously missing were Hyderabad, Quetta and Multan, to name a few. Why were there no protests in these urban centres? One could speculate, analyse and debate; but would it not be an act of futility? Ultimately, the cities must reflect on their own silence, and speak for themselves.

The waves of protest were not tidal waves sweeping aside all and sundry in one giant sweep of anger. They were small and self-contained; and herein lay their strength, because the protests were loud and clear, and focused. There was no stoning and burning and looting. With dignity the violation of women's dignity was condemned. Though non-violent, they were closely watched by the machinery of state-violence, and in sane places it whimsically crashed on the protesters as if compelled to justify its existence.

The waves of protest were initially triggered off by social action groups and women's groups like WAR (War Against Rape) and WAF (Women's Action Forum), and were courageously supported by many other groups and individuals. This outburst was non-partisan, and was vigorously backed by the women's wing of PPP. Close at their heels was PDA, to be rapidly followed by the verbal protests of some well-entrenched politicians and politicised groups.

Most conspicuous in the politicised protests was Jamaat-e-Islami. It is difficult to recall whether Jamaat-e-Islami, and other politicians now expressing their indignation at the gang rape of women, had ever publicly expressed disapproval at other reported incidents of rape! Their concern, of course, is welcome, but how is one to assess their seriousness! Will they be willing to discuss this most abject of violence with their male party workers and supporters? Are they prepared to have their male workers/supporters examine rape as the ultimate expression of all violence inflicted on women? Will they honestly explore their perception of women and attempt to understand how rape is linked with the way men consciously or unconsciously see women?

If they allow themselves, they will realise that our tradition has used women as a convenient means for vengeance, and men have suppressed women in order to mitigate the risks to male honour. Thus, girls' right to seek knowledge, is restricted; their choice of work curtailed; their right to sports and cultural activities thwarted. In short, their potential creativity is inhibited, simply because of the vulnerability of a peculiar aspect of male pride and, perhaps, when all this happens, sexual exploitation of women increases.

The political parties who clamoured to denounce the torture and humiliation of Khursheed Begum and Veena Hayat, will they be prepared to spare some moments to

reflect over the socio-economic and political determinants of rape? Will they be courageous enough to listen to the deep fears that haunt women? They need not go far, and turn to the women of their families and their women party workers.

Do they think they could engender sufficient trust to enable their women to narrate what they fear most about men; and to define the type of male-female relationship they desire, and for which their party should struggle? But such dialogue between men and women is not easy. It requires an unconditional and honest respect for women, and an earnest desire to understand the role of male-perception of women in the vulnerability of women as women.

Rape as a tool of oppression is a gory expression of man's brutality towards women. This heinous act becomes more nauseating when perpetrated as a planned strategy of suppression. When this form of oppression appears in a feudal setting (as in the recent cases near Multan) it is a declaration of a feudal power's ultimate contempt of the powerless. When this contempt stalks the urban centres and deliberately hunts down women to rape them for their direct or indirect affiliation with a political party, feudal and political debauchery becomes one.

But political debauchery becomes more despicable when a woman is kidnapped and raped while her husband is being tried for some crimes supposedly committed by his party. His being a suspect magically transforms his wife into an easy prey for those determined to exercise an eerie privilege to strike at men by demeaning their women.

This conscious and traditional act became more conscious when after being raped the woman was told that her violation was a 'gift' to her husband.... This was rape committed fearlessly not because the criminals were confident of dodging the law or had support of a traditional power base, but perhaps because they had the sanction of power duly legalised by the state. They were no ordinary criminals who rape and loot. They were 'official' criminals because they were part of an official organ of the state—i.e., the police.

This was not the first alleged custodial rape. But custodial rape lifted itself to new heights when a home was turned into the 'custodial arena' of unhampered torture. The despicable happening within the chardavari of 'policy custody' acquired an indescribable grotesqueness when undertaken within the sanction of a home. A dual degradation took place, as a woman and the sanctity of her home were violated simultaneously.

The role-call of recent victims is grim: Khursheed Begum (Karachi); Veena Hayat, (Karachi); Aasia Ayub (Rawalpindi); a pregnant woman dragged out of her house by 26 armed men, and gang raped in public (Beetvani, near Multan); a young girl assaulted by an "influential" person of her area (Green Town, Lahore); an eight-year-old girl, raped and murdered (Lahore); a young patient from Lala Musa, raped by four men (Lahore); a

four-year-old girl raped by a forty-year-old man (Briha road, Naushero Feroze, Nawabshah); a five-year-old sexually assaulted by the salesman of a bakery (Karachi); a nine-year-old raped (Karachi) ... and let us not forget the horror stories of Machharwali and Nawabpur.

But this is only the tip of the iceberg ... the tip is tiny; and the iceberg is ominously colossal, floating heavily and silently in an ice-cold sea....

Five patterns are discernable: protected by a chardavai a man rapes a child... a number of men rape a woman; protected by the walls of police stations, policemen rape women; shielded by age-old feudal power, dacoits loot and rape; intoxicated by their feudal power, men rape women publicly; backed by state-power, trained oppressors break into homes to torture and rape.

The last appears to be the latest twist to the deadly humiliation of women. Women's right to dignity and security of person, guaranteed by the UN Charter of Human Rights, the constitution of Pakistan, and Islam, has been ripped apart. Justice and peace, the goal and desire of humanity lies mutilated. The waves of protest recently witnessed were an assertion of our right to justice and peace. They were yet another step against the unacceptable. They symbolise an age-old determination of humanity to retrieve justice and peace from the backyard of society.

### **Continuing Illiteracy Said Harming National Interests**

92AS1206B Islamabad THE MUSLIM in English  
27 Jun 92 p 5

[Article by Zia Ul Islam: "Unemployment and Literacy: A Common Solution"]

[Text] Unemployment overthrows governments. Illiteracy destroys nations. Together, the two evils consume entire generations of people just as the twin menace of water-logging and salinity turns fertile soil into barren wasteland.

Both evils are gnawing at the flesh of Pakistan like giant rats. For most governments unemployment is a more serious threat because it seems nearer whereas illiteracy can wait, specially in an unawakened country like Pakistan where those who should be worried about the future of the nation are busy taking care of their present. But illiteracy simply cannot wait. No country can expect to progress at all unless its people are reasonably equipped with knowledge.

It needs no debate to prove this point: no country has in the entire history of the world until today, progressed into a genuinely developed nation without a majority of its people being educated. Oil or minerals may bring riches, not development!

It is, however, difficult to blame governments in poorer countries when they push away literacy and education

into the backyard and give priority to more immediate issues like unemployment and provision of utilities. After all, their first priority is to stay in power. With millions of unemployed men and women yelling at their heels and millions more shouting hoarse for water and health-care, it is difficult for any government to invest in an area like education whose returns in any case will not be visible for several years, perhaps decades.

Spending on education is like planting a tree, whose fruit the farmer well knows will not be ready for him but for his children. While an individual can think and plant for his children, a degenerated society, collectively, is almost incapable of such altruistic thinking.

Will education then, continue to sob like an orphan who receives ample sympathy and lip-service but little investment? I think this is not a zero-sum game. It is not really necessary to sacrifice one priority over the other. Which is why I have brought the two problems of unemployment and illiteracy together. There exists a great plan where both the problems can be addressed simultaneously. A single investment can be utilised in such a manner that it will minimise both the evils systematically and simultaneously. Like all innovative schemes, of course, it will need a high degree of commitment by the government and the getting together of a few determined and dedicated persons to execute the plan.

The main target of the plan is to create a nucleus of well trained school teachers out of the available pool of unemployed educated young men and women. Thus, as more and more unemployed youths get jobs, the cause of education and literacy is furthered with the growing reservoir of trained teachers. Seems simple enough on paper. In reality it is a little complicated in Pakistan. So let us examine some of the more important hurdles and ways and means to overcome these complications. But before we do that it is necessary to briefly understand if the plan is really a worthwhile solution to the twin menace of unemployment and illiteracy.

As I said above, no country can dream of progressing without a reasonable level of literacy and education. No amount of industrialisation or investment, including foreign investment, on which we seem to be pinning a lot of hopes, can bring real progress unless they are accompanied by a fast increase in literacy rate. Examples of South Korea, Singapore, Taiwan, Hong Kong and now Malaysia are more than revealing in this respect. None of them made any headway towards prosperity until their literacy rates climbed well above 50 percent.

Pakistan with its official 27 percent rate of literacy (which a UN report puts at a shameful 16 percent), cannot and should not expect to create a world record by progressing with around 80 percent of its people unable to read and write! Miracles are rare in these difficult times and even if a miracle were to happen in the world today, I see little likelihood that Pakistan could be at the receiving end. We rarely try to do anything to deserve it!

It is easy to see why literacy and education are essential to usher in an industrial revolution, which no doubt is our last hope for survival. Industrialists and entrepreneurs need talent; they need growing numbers of engineers, accountants and other professional men and women. Above all, they need large numbers of literate workers. Modern factories cannot run with illiterate labour.

Semi-skilled labourers are so scarce here that many local and foreign investors have had to turn back from several new fields. The trouble is that the totally illiterate person cannot even be trained to become a semi-skilled worker. It follows, therefore, that an industrial revolution is possible only if it is accompanied by an equally intense educational revolution.

The kind of education most required in a country like Pakistan is primary and secondary, leading to technical expertise to fit in with the industrial requirement, not the high sounding, art-for-art's-sake college education! To impart this kind of education, we need a large number of well-trained teachers. In fact, there is so much illiteracy in this country that even if we train all our educated unemployed men and women into teachers we shall still fall short of the number we require.

This brings us to the first great hurdle: why would a majority of the matriculates, FAs, BAs, and MAs opt for becoming primary and secondary school teachers? If the government continues to give them cosy office jobs they scarcely deserve, they would surely not opt for teachers' jobs. If, however, pushed to the wall by the runaway increase in the establishment's expenses, the government finally decides that enough is enough and that no jobs will be available to anyone except teachers' jobs then of course the genuinely unemployed will opt for these jobs. This is where the strong will and firm determination of the government will have to be demonstrated clearly if the plan is to be implemented.

An environment will have to be created which convinces everyone that no other job in the government is available at least for another three years. Once the nation is taken into confidence by personal appeal through the media, the government will be absolved of the responsibility of looking after those educated unemployed who do not come forward to take part in the plan. This in itself should be a big plus point for any political government. In order not to jeopardise the future of those who wish and deserve to go into other government departments, a general 3-year relaxation in age should be given to those who compete for government jobs as and when they are made available after the 3-year ban is lifted. Thus no element of force or injustice can be alleged. And of course the private sector is always open for those who still do not wish to become teachers even for three years!

The second hurdle, of course, is the financing. Once the government is convinced that the much awaited industrial revolution is not possible without education, it will find ways to create the necessary funds. Sources from

where funds may be diverted to this cause are many: zakat and usher, bait ul maal, self-employment schemes, grants for higher education, even an across-the-board cut in all other allocations.

The diversion of resources is amply justified by the fact that in the present circumstances imparting education to the nation is of the most crucial importance, more so because we do not want to lose the benefits of the great effort being made to industrialise. Given sufficient courage, funds can even be diverted from regular revenue and capital budgets and by postponing all other projects for a period of three years.

The plan works something like this: all the educated youth who come forward are recruited at a fixed stipend of around Rs 3000/per month, initially for a training period of 6 to 12 months. This can be done at the district headquarter level. Teacher-trainers already in private or government service may be given an incentive to work after office hours while others may be employed to work in the evenings. All recruits will be trained in intensive evening classes to be held in government and public sector officers which, in any case, are not utilised during these hours. The heads of these buildings themselves can be directed to arrange for the holding of classes. After all, we are talking of an educational revolution, not a routine exercise! Anyone and everyone who can must do his bit.

While school teachers are being trained, construction of primary schools should commence at full speed all over the country so that as soon as trained teachers come out of the training, schools are ready to start work. Moreover, thousands of public buildings are available after office hours and can easily be converted into regular evening schools.

The plan is really a crash programme to get things going. Once the teachers' training system takes off, it will turn into a self-propelled cycle. The trained teachers will be free to leave after two years unless they wish to continue.

More will be trained from the fresh graduates coming out of colleges. It could be made mandatory for every graduate to get teacher-training and to teach at least for one or two years before hitting the job market, including government vacancies of all kinds. While every student will be assured of the teaching job and at least Rs 3000 per month from day one of his passing the graduation exam, the nation will be assured of a regular supply of well-trained, willing teachers to educate every single citizen.

Most of the above may look rather impulsive and unpracticable, if not downright foolish. But then, we are even more foolish to be living in a country of utter illiterates and talking glibly about progressing!

In Pakistan, less than six million out of its 16 million school-age children scarcely see the door of a school. This includes thousands of "schools" in remote areas, which in fact, have no doors at all because they exist under trees. Such a country has no right to see dreams of prosperity.

Out of the fortunate 6 million who have access to something resembling a school, more than half drop out within the first two years! You don't need a calculator to find out what kind of persons we are preparing for our future. But, here, perhaps I have used the wrong word. It is "their" future, not "ours," and we would rather take care of our own present. "Eat, drink and be merry," say the wiser, more worldly, and "practical" amongst us.

They can afford to say it because their own children are studying abroad. What they do not realise is that this state of affairs cannot continue for long: the sheer weight of ridiculousness and unnaturalness of the system will bring it crashing down. And when the crash arrives, neither the children nor their smug parents will be able to shield themselves from the flying ashes and bits and pieces of a once great country.

**END OF  
FICHE**

**DATE FILMED**

31 July 1992